

Social Science Programme
in Media and Communications
Uppsala University

**Civic Advocacy Journalism in Practice:
Reports on the Copenhagen Climate Change Summit**

- A Master's Thesis -

Marites Quiano Raposas
Student

Göran Svensson
Supervisor

Table of Contents

THESIS ABSTRACT	3
KEYWORDS.....	3
1. INTRODUCTION	4
2. PROBLEM, QUESTION AND OBJECTIVES.....	8
2.1 PROBLEM STATEMENT.....	8
2.2 RESEARCH QUESTION	9
2.3 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES.....	9
3. BACKGROUND	10
3.1 THE SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT COMPONENT OF CAJ.....	10
3.2 THE COPENHAGEN CLIMATE CHANGE SUMMIT	12
3.3 MEDIA PARTICIPATION AT THE SUMMIT	13
3.3.1 <i>Media reportage</i>	13
3.3.2 <i>Media support</i>	14
3.3.3 <i>Media accreditation</i>	14
3.3.4 <i>Media trainings</i>	15
4. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	15
4.1 CAJ AND THE PRINCIPLE OF MEDIA AND MORALITY	16
4.2 NEWS AND ANALYSIS	25
4.3 MAINSTREAM AND ALTERNATIVE MEDIA.....	26
4.4 NOTES ON SUBJECTIVITY	28
5. METHODOLOGY	29
5.1 WHY CONTENT ANALYSIS?	29
5.2 WHY QUALITATIVE?	31
6. ANALYTICAL DESIGN	32
6.1 SELECTION CRITERIA	33
6.2 CLUSTERING OF IDEAS	35
7. FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS	36
7.1 CLASSIFICATION OF THE 40 ARTICLES	38
7.2 CAJ COMPONENTS IN THE SAMPLE.....	47
7.2.1 <i>Overlapping Components</i>	55
7.2.2 <i>Summary of Dominance and Overlap of CAJ Components</i>	56
7.3 MAINSTREAM AND ALTERNATIVE MEDIA.....	57
7.4 NEWS AND ANALYSIS	59
7.5 JOURNALISTS' STANDPOINTS ON THE SUMMIT	62
7.6 THE GENDER PERSPECTIVE.....	64
7.7 SUMMARY ANALYSIS.....	65
8. CONCLUSIONS AND DISCUSSIONS	74
APPENDIX 1	79
APPENDIX 2	81
REFERENCES	84
1. ACADEMIC SOURCES.....	84
2. ARTICLES' SITES/URLS	85
3. OTHER RELEVANT REFERENCES	89

THESIS ABSTRACT

With the changing political, economic, cultural and environmental landscape of global societies, journalistic writings on social development issues and concerns have become more relevant in recent times. Through civic advocacy journalism (CAJ), the agenda and programs of social development movements, civil society groups, international development organizations and non-government organizations are promoted and advanced.

It is essential to understand the forms and representations of CAJ in practice, concepts and theories in the light of its relevance to media practice and to society at large. However, there is very little literature on the scope and extent of CAJ knowledge and practice. A researcher needs to look into actual practice and connect this with available literature to establish the application of CAJ. For this study, a qualitative content analysis method was used to assess CAJ practice in online print media reports at the Copenhagen Climate Change Summit.

KEYWORDS

Alternative Media

Civic Advocacy Journalism

Civil Society Groups

Copenhagen Climate Change Summit (CCCS)

International Development Organizations

Mainstream Media

Media Advocacy

Media and Morality

News and Analysis

Social Development Movements

1. INTRODUCTION

As a practicing journalist in the 1990s, I became aware of the many efforts made by non-governmental organizations (NGOs), civil society movements and social development organizations (government or non-government) in tapping the mainstream or alternative media to promote their social development agenda. This practice has become a serious preoccupation of these groups and organizations such that full-blown coordinated efforts to involve the media in the information-dissemination process of their programs and projects continue to be carried-out in grander and bigger scales. Some of these organizations include the United Nations and its various agencies, bilateral (government to government) funding mechanisms like SIDA and CIDA, multilateral organizations like the Asian Development Bank, international funding NGOs like the Ford Foundation and the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation as well as social development movements like Amnesty International or World Wide Fund for Nature (WWF) among many others.

Back in the 1990s, there was no coined terminology to identify this type of media involvement. Some years later, I remember encountering a book entitled “Spin Works: A Media Guidebook for Communicating Values and Shaping Opinions” by Robert Bray published in 2000.¹ It is a book of strategies and tactics marketed to NGOs and social development organizations in engaging the press as a sounding board for advocating social issues and concerns. With this publication, one might infer that journalistic reportage on social development issues is already an active genre at that time.

Yet, one cannot really pinpoint the beginnings and history of this type of journalism because of the lack of written materials that essay its history in terms of scope and application. My literature search on the history or beginnings on this subject produced no definite dates or era which is why it is difficult to pinpoint when it has actually started except to say that it evolved around the development of civil society movements and social causes along with the embodiment of social development principles and democratic ideals that these social development organizations promote.

¹ Bray Robert, Spin Works: A Media Guidebook for Communicating Values and Shaping Opinions: San Francisco, California: Independent Media Institute. 2000.

At that time, many journalists may or may not even be aware if they have engaged or practiced this type of journalism reportage. For one, there was no coined terminology that generally defines this practice. There was also the lack of literature that identified the concepts, forms and representations of this type of reportage from both journalistic and academic references.

This time, in the course of the literature review I have done for this thesis, I have come across the works of Silvio Waisbord who articulated the concepts and forms of this type of journalistic practice quite pointedly and extensively. He used the terminology Civic Advocacy Journalism (CAJ) to capture the forms and representations of this type of journalism which addresses social development issues. This is also the same terminology that I will adopt for the purposes of this study because it comprehensively encompasses the nature and facets of this type of journalism practice. Waisbord likewise recognized in his works that this type of journalistic reportage is often associated with civil society movements and social causes – similar to what journalists like myself have perceived from practice.

Since there was only Waisbord's works that extensively depict this type of journalism, it may be said that this type of journalism although not a new practice is still young in terms of its academic representations in form and substance. Therefore, a study that looks into the connection of the actual practice of CAJ and its theoretical ground might contribute something to our understanding of the nature and scope of CAJ as a branch of journalism.

By choosing an event that serves as the focal point for analysis, we may be able to identify its concepts and applications in practice. For this, I have chosen the Copenhagen Climate Change Summit (CCCS), a global environmental event held in December 2009.

This research will utilize a qualitative content analysis as a methodology on which I will try to establish the expressions and patterns of journalistic works at the CCCS in the context of CAJ. I will also try to connect it with existing academic concepts and theories in journalism particularly, the CAJ concepts by Silvio Waisbord and Media and Morality by Roger Silverstone. Understanding the similarities and differences in the practical applications between news and analysis and between mainstream and alternative media outfits will also be discussed as an integral part of the content analysis.

As CAJ is primarily connected to the principle of social development and social change adopted by international social development organizations and civil society groups, this type of journalism produces stories on social issues like climate change, gender inequality, poverty and exploitation, among others. In CAJ, the role of the journalist is crucial in shaping public opinion as well as policy and governance around the world. Their works reflect the essence of being watchdogs of society. Many journalists believe that it is no longer enough to simply observe what's going on around us and afterwards report in a somewhat robotic fashion, which is generally expected of them to do. In CAJ, journalists become social change agents, wittingly or unwittingly.

Waisbord's works emphasize a growing call for CAJ practice. Yet, there seems to be quite a limited understanding on the forms and representations of CAJ among media theorists and even among journalists. The theorizing and conceptual development of CAJ in connection to practice remains a largely unexplored area. Theorizing CAJ needs to be broadened and its practical implications made more expansive. Moreover, the connection between existing theories and actual practice from the ground needs to be further ascertained and determined.

Thus, the point of this study. Contemporary times of globalization, migration, environmental woes and growing population point to escalating social issues and with this, the role of media as the fourth estate and society's sentinel comes to fore, drawing more attention and emphasis to the concepts and principles of CAJ.

CAJ should not be mistaken with other branches of journalism with some aspects of ingraining public or community consciousness in its practice. These include: citizen or grassroots journalism, advocacy journalism and development or developmental journalism. While CAJ is clear in its strategy to involve mainstream and alternative media in addressing social development issues, these other branches have other functions and applications.

Citizen journalism or grassroots journalism refers to journalism practice from the ground and within the community to achieve certain goals and aspirations. Although it entails adapting to the use of media technology in the information highway, it does not necessarily require involving "professional" media practitioners and journalists in its conventional sense. In citizen or grassroots journalism, the citizenry equip themselves with media skills and savvy in

order to create positive changes in their lives (Gillmore, 2004: pp. 8 – 14).² It is journalism in the hands of practically anyone as Gillmore put it:

“We could all write, not just read, in ways never before possible. Anyone with access to a computer and internet connection could own a press. Just about anyone could make the news” (Gillmore, 2004: p. 24).³

Advocacy journalism is the larger branch of tapping mainstream and alternative media in promoting certain agenda but it is a catch-all phrase in the sense that its processes is not specific to social issues. It may be used for pushing certain governmental political systems, political institutions and political personalities (Waisbord, 2004; pp: 371-385). On the other hand, CAJ clearly addresses social development issues and concerns.⁴

Development or developmental journalism is specially patterned after the needs and purposes of developing countries wherein media strategies take into consideration the situation and characteristics of poor and developing countries (Xu Xiaoge, 2008: pp: 357-370).⁵ For Xiaoge, development journalism is premised on giving voices to ordinary people and empowering the poor and the marginalized. As such, it entails a certain bias towards the viewpoints of ordinary people instead of the elite, and a bias towards grassroots organizations instead of top level institutions. (Xu Xiaoge, 2008: pp: 357-370).⁶ This bias in reportage towards certain fragments and elements of society renders this type of journalism somewhat unqualified to claim a global platform in news representation in the light of changing global developments.

Taking all these other types of journalism into consideration and Waisbord’s pronouncements of what constitute CAJ, we can then deduce that CAJ is a type of journalism that delves on social issues and concerns; utilizes established or professional mainstream and alternative media industry as the news carriers; emphasizes the crucial role of the journalist in surfacing

² Gillmor Dan, *We the Media*: 2004, Grassroots Journalism by the People, for the People, 301 pp., California: O’Reilly Media.

³ Gillmor Dan, *We the Media*: 2004, Grassroots Journalism by the People, for the People, 301 pp., California: O’Reilly Media.

⁴ Waisbord, Silvio, 2008. *Advocacy Journalism in a Global Context*. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, pp. 371–385, New York: Routledge.

⁵ Xiaoge, Xu 2008. *Development Journalism*. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, pp. 357-370. New York: Routledge.

⁶ Ibid

and publicizing social development issues; promotes the agenda and advocacies of social development organizations and carries an inclusive voice and global implications in its reportage.

My thesis hopes to establish qualitative patterns and trends of CAJ gathered from online print media reports on the Copenhagen Climate Change Summit (CCCS) both in news and analysis form and in mainstream and alternative media outlets. This research wants to look at the spread of topics that were tackled, descriptions of global representations of stories and articles⁷ including the connectedness of CAJ practice to existing academic concepts and theories.

This qualitative content analysis of online print media reports at the CCCS would hopefully contribute to a wider understanding of the state of civic advocacy journalism as it is practiced today.

2. PROBLEM, QUESTION AND OBJECTIVES

2.1 PROBLEM STATEMENT

The presence and existence of CAJ as a type of journalism has various manifestations in the media industry. Suffice it to say that it exists for a reason and a purpose. But available literature shows that little is known of the scope and extent of its structure, constructs and applicability in concepts and form. The dearth of materials available on the subject could lead to misconceptions on the nature and essence of CAJ. Thus there is the need to further establish its scope empirically. With persistent calls for more socially-oriented media reports, the need to understand and apply this type of journalism have been outlined by media academics such as Waisbord, Silverstone and Benhabib.

As there seems to be a disconnect in the understanding of CAJ theories and actual practice, conducting an empirical research that would delve on the basic concepts and forms of CAJ

⁷ Articles and stories which refers to journalistic output without distinction were used interchangeably throughout this paper

might contribute to our deeper understanding of the connection between CAJ theorizing and practice. This research might, in a way, illustrate the relevance of this branch of journalism to journalism practice and to society at large.

2.2 RESEARCH QUESTION

The main question that this study wants to answer is: What are the forms and representations of CAJ based on selected print online reports at the CCCS?

This research focuses on contributing to the understanding of CAJ as a branch of journalism and to supplement current theorizing and conceptual review of CAJ using empirical materials. Correspondingly, this contribution in theorizing and conceptual review might also extend to the improvement and advancement of the actual practice.

2.3 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

The **general objectives** of this research is to be able to:

1. Identify CAJ forms and concepts from academic materials (i.e. academic papers by Silvio Waisbord in connection with the theory and principle of media and morality by Roger Silverstone)
2. Conduct a qualitative content analysis study of print online media reports that would depict actual CAJ practice using a specific event (the CCCS in this case)
3. Establish the connection between the CAJ forms and concepts (along with the theory and principle of media and morality) as found in the qualitative content analysis on the CCCS and those found in academic materials.

The **specific objectives** of this research is to:

1. Determine major CAJ components in the sample articles through the process of clustering
2. Assess the standpoints of the journalists in the articles in relation to CAJ forms, concepts and representations
3. Identify CAJ applications with regards to news and analysis reportage and mainstream and alternative media at the CCCS
4. Determine CAJ applications at the CCCS with respect to gender concerns
5. Distinguish other forms of CAJ that may be derived from the content analysis apart from those mentioned in academic materials

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 The Social Development Component of CAJ

As a type of journalistic reportage, civic advocacy journalism is closely lodged on the principles of social development. This sub-section provides a brief discussion of some basic social development principles by noted academics and theoreticians in the social development field. By understanding some of these principles we may be able to see points of concurrence of these principles and the practice of CAJ.

James Midgley in his Book, *Social Development: The Development Perspective in Social Welfare* (Midgley, 1995: PP. 1-2)⁸ defined social development as an approach for promoting human welfare with a distinct feature to attempt to harmonize social policies with measures to promote socio-economic development. It emphasizes universality and macro-focus and is relevant to all societies who desire to achieve and promote economic development and better quality of life. Social development as defined by Midgley applies planned intervention and promotes a dynamic, inclusive and change-oriented approach in addressing social issues including poverty and environmental concerns among others. In contrast, Midgley referred to the term “distorted development” to describe the exclusion of sections of the population from full participation in development which takes the form of the oppression of women for

⁸ James, Midgley. *Social Development: The Development Perspective in Social Welfare*, SAGE Publications 1995, London.

example, or the rampant exploitation of natural resources in the name of industrial progress. The concept of social development is differentiated with the concept of charity of philanthropic individuals or groups. In effect, “only when a high degree of social well being or quality of life is emphasized is it considered as a social development goal.” (Midgley, 1995: PP. 1-2)⁹

Charles Elliot in his book *Development Debate*¹⁰ refers to development as a state or condition of achieving social goals, presence of political will and decision-making, empowering the marginalized section of society, participation of the broad population as well as economic justice and distribution. Elliot also touched on the inevitability of structural change if called for.

The staunch presence of international social development organizations is a continuing proof of the growing prominence and legitimacy of the social development agenda. The biggest organization that carry its organizational mandate within the social development framework is the United Nations. Founded in 1945 with 192 member states, the United Nations was formed on the basis of the principles of peace and security, human development and human rights.¹¹

The United Nations is also the backbone of the Copenhagen Climate Change Summit implementing body. The direct correlation of CAJ and the institutional mandate of the United Nations and other social development organizations was evident in the call for participation to attend media trainings with emphasis on CAJ. These media trainings or fellowships were either organized or sponsored by UN agencies. In the case of the CCCS, the UNFCCC organized and funded a series of trainings for journalists covering the event.

It may be inferred that CAJ adheres to the principle and practice of applying some aspects of lobbying to push for certain positive results or agenda of specific social concerns. It is not to say that these journalistic works are fabricated, unfounded or without basis, it is just that at some critical points, journalists take a clear stand and present their perspectives on certain social issues.

⁹ Midgley, P. 1-2

¹⁰ Charles Elliot, *Development Debate*, S.C.M. Press, 1971, 128 pp., London.

¹¹ <http://www.un.org/en/aboutun/index.shtml>

3.2 The Copenhagen Climate Change Summit

The Copenhagen Summit that took place in December 2009 was organized as a global effort to curb the warming of the climate due to the warming trend caused by greenhouse gasses in the atmosphere. Previously reported as 0.6 degrees Celsius in 2001, it is now 0.74 degrees Celsius. This warming of the climate system has been found on the earth's surface, in the atmosphere and in the oceans (Reporting Copenhagen, 2009: P. 22).¹²

The Summit emerged out of a concern to monitor human activities on climate change according to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change or the UNFCCC (Reporting Copenhagen, 2009: P.2).¹³ The UNFCCC Media Brief Report declared that the world has come to a point where the global effects of climate change can no longer be ignored. Considered as one of the massive challenges in our midst, the emphasis for international action to combat climate change cannot be stressed enough. It is a long term goal that entails mitigation and adaptation, technology transfer, capacity building, financing and investments. If interventions are not applied and green technologies are not implemented, emissions will go up to 50% by 2050 instead of down by 50% as science requires (Reporting Copenhagen, 2009: P. 14).¹⁴

The adverse and damaging effects of climate change need to be curbed if not reverted. These adverse effects include: 50% less yield from rain-fed agriculture in some African countries by 2020; widespread melting of glaciers and snow cover which reduces the melt water supply from major mountain ranges where more than 1 billion people currently live; and continuous displacement of millions of people by sudden climate change disasters including 20 million in 2008 and an estimated 200 million by 2050 (Reporting Copenhagen, 2009: P. 16).¹⁵

We can already see some of these impact happening in the world, many of these cases were documented happening in South Asia and South East Asia as evidenced by the excessive decrease in crop yield, high incidence of mortality due to illness associated with floods and

¹² Reporting Copenhagen, COP Press Kit, UNFCCC, December 2009, Copenhagen.

¹³ Ibid

¹⁴ Reporting Copenhagen, P. 14

¹⁵ Reporting Copenhagen, P. 16

drought, and coastal hazards due to sea-level rise (World Bank Issue Brief on Climate Change).¹⁶

Regions that are specially affected have been identified as: the Arctic, Africa, Small Island Developing States, Asian Megadeltas and the Himalayan. Areas expected to get the brunt of negative effects are food, fibre and forest products, freshwater resources and their management, ecosystems, coastal areas and low-lying areas, health and industry, and settlement and society (Reporting Copenhagen, 2009: PP. 25 - 28).¹⁷

3.3 Media Participation at the Summit

This sub-section describes the process of media participation at the CCCS. It provides the backdrop of the journalists' coverage of the event. It describes media reportage, media support, media accreditation and media trainings.

3.3.1 Media reportage

There were around 3,500 media practitioners accredited by the UNFCCC Secretariat to cover the Copenhagen Climate Change Summit. The bulk of the talks for international action was expected to have taken place here and media participation was seen as a major crux of the event. Journalists produced their reports on decision points and highlights of daily events. Through press conferences, arranged interviews and open attendance to plenary, media symposia, side events, and other Summit details, journalists were there to report on the state of affairs and other activities at the Summit. Banking on the multiplier effect of published media works, journalists were expected to reach out to millions of readers worldwide and bring to public attention the different facets of the climate change issue from policy-making, governance and its human development dimensions. On top of this is a conscious effort on the part of journalists to convey the technical aspects of climate change in a less technical language and in more comprehensible terms.

¹⁶<http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/NEWS/0,,contentMDK:20432982~menuPK:34480~pagePK:64257043~piPK:437376~theSitePK:4607,00.html>

¹⁷ Reporting Copenhagen, P. 25 – 28

3.3.2 Media support

Print media journalists were only allowed access to open meetings. But the print media was not far behind in terms of technical support. These technical support include an area for print journalists with 1,104 work spaces that had 864 PlugNPlay Ethernet plugs and 240 laptops free access; internet cafes within the venue that offered free use of computers with webcams and headphones for Skype and Messenger Services; wireless access which was made available throughout the venue; a Media Information Desk that took care of reproducing materials and documentation; downloadable proceedings which were made available from the Summit's website; while requests for interviews with heads of state and other government officials were made possible through the UNFCCC Media Office (Reporting Copenhagen, 2009).¹⁸

3.3.3 Media accreditation

Applying for media accreditation to cover the Summit was considerably demanding. There were tedious requirements to comply with. A journalist applying for accreditation had to complete an online accreditation form, must possess a letter of assignment on official letterhead signed by the publisher and editor with the name and specified title of the journalist, a photocopy of valid press card and a photocopy of valid passport or national identification card.

These credentials were then scanned into a graphic format and sent by fax or email to the media section of the UNFCCC Secretariat. In addition, journalists were also required to submit copies or links of bylined articles within the last four months and a copy of their publication. These requirements were asked from all journalists whether they were regular staff and correspondents or freelance practitioners at the time of application (press accreditation, UNFCCC website).¹⁹

Only after these requirements were submitted that the actual processing of application begins and even with these requirements fulfilled, there is no guarantee that a journalist would be granted an accreditation.

¹⁸ Reporting Copenhagen, PP. 32, 34, 42

¹⁹ http://unfccc.int/press/calendar_of_events/accreditation/items/2987.php

These stringent requirements were applied to ensure that individuals applying for accreditation are bona fide media professionals and represent bona fide media organizations. Accreditation is only issued after a track record of reporting for media organizations on international affairs had been established. With this intent, media accreditation was not extended to information outlets of non-government organizations (press accreditation, UNFCCC).²⁰

3.3.4 Media trainings

The Summit organizers enabled the participation of journalists specially those coming from developing countries to attend media trainings and also facilitated their capacity to cover the event. These training workshops sought to raise the awareness of media practitioners on the climate change issue and the UNFCCC processes. With support from the Danish, Swedish, Norwegian, and Dutch governments, these workshops contributed to the strengthening of collaboration between international social development organizations and the media. (media workshops, UNFCCC Website)²¹

4. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

In the introduction section of this paper, I have laid down the basic premise that civic advocacy journalism is closely linked to the social development concepts and principles promoted by international development organizations and civil society groups through their projects and programs.

In this section, I shall delve further on the concepts and theories of civic advocacy journalism based mainly on Silvio Waisbord's papers as these are the only academic materials I found that depict CAJ more extensively. In conjunction with Waisbord's materials, I shall also discuss the theory and concepts of media morality as thoroughly presented by Roger Silverstone.

²⁰ http://unfccc.int/press/calender_of_events/accreditation/items/2987.php

²¹ http://unfccc.int/press/media_outreach/items/3015.php

4.1 CAJ and the Principle of Media and Morality

CAJ as a social development –oriented type of journalism is deeply entrenched in the principle of media and morality. This connection will be substantiated in this sub-section of my paper.

It is mainly through CAJ practice that media plays a central role in recognizing the rights of social development stakeholders through the politics of recognition (Waisbord, 2009: P. 9 citing Fraser 1997)²² which shows in their political stands. This practice of making known the socio-political stance in their works was asserted by some media academics including Roger Silverstone, Silvio Waisbord and Seyla Benhabib. Such leaning towards making political statements in the works of media academics contributed to the theoretical basis of CAJ as a branch of journalism.

It is on this course of presentation that I will make the connection between CAJ and the theory and concepts of media and morality. It is apparent in the literature review that the principles of media and morality serve as an essential backbone of CAJ practice as evidenced by the ensuing pronouncements that Roger Silverstone have asserted.

Roger Silverstone in his book *Media and Morality: On the Rise of the Mediapolis* underscored the necessity of media morality in a more and more globalized context. His book is an indirect call to CAJ practice, providing the impetus for journalists to look into their conscience and morality as they report on global events and its impact on humanity. Silverstone talked about a crisis in the world of communication that is characterized by moral, ethical and political grounds. This mediated environment is so polluted that it is “threatening our capacity to sustain a level of humanity. It is only by attending to its possibilities that we will be able to reverse what otherwise will be a downward spiral towards increasing global incomprehension and inhumanity” (Silverstone, vi).²³

²² Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

²³ Roger Silverstone, *Media and Morality: On the Rise of the Mediapolis*: Cambridge: Polity Press. 2007.

It is in this same vein that the socio-political and socio-economic conditions in human life are addressed and presented in CAJ.

Silverstone evoked a global space he called a mediapolis that is both shared and shareable, singular and plural, mediated and immediate where there are endless possibilities for media space in the formation of social, civic and moral space – a mediapolis where media can be a designated place for civility, humanity and responsibility (Silverstone, P. 5)²⁴. Instead of the usual apathy, practitioners should claim the critical role of media in this “formation of social, civic and moral space” which translates into practice of media fairness and integrity.

The new moral agenda according to Silverstone creates a space for media hospitality, responsibility, obligation and judgment that requires attention to media justice (Silverstone, 2008: P38 -41)²⁵. This refers to a media space that is not selective and exclusive but inclusive and accommodating which in a sense is media democratization in action (Waisbord, 2009: P. 8).²⁶

This concept of responsibility and obligation of media practitioners is also embodied in Waisbord’s concept of CAJ where he claimed that journalists pursuing CAJ are most possibly motivated by a certain sense of duty to humanity and society, sometimes going beyond what is called for in a story and beyond personal interests and gratification (Waisbord, 2008: P.378).²⁷ In the same breadth, it is the multiple roles of media as an actor, spectator and narrator that accomplishes history and makes the polis a productive place to organize memories (Silverstone, 2007, citing Kristeva, 2001: PP- 53 – 54).²⁸

It might be noted that taking a political stand is also crucial in order to successfully assume all these multiple roles. For there can be no genuine media justice without publicizing certain political stands. An equal, just, humane and democratic society is most often ensured with political statements that facilitate the attainment of these goals. The politics referred herein is

²⁴ Ibid

²⁵ Ibid

²⁶ Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

²⁷ Waisbord, Silvio, 2008. Advocacy Journalism in a Global Context. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, 371-385, New York: Routledge.

²⁸ Roger Silverstone, *Media and Morality: On the Rise of the Mediapolis*: Cambridge: Polity Press. 2007.

not the usual partisan politics but a self-imposed guideline that generates a higher form of social consciousness – one that looks out for society’s common good.

The concept of “civic imagination” as a thinking mode was brought up by Silverstone when he cited Seyla Benhabib in her recent study of Arendt’s political thinking called civic imagination. Quoting Benhabib:

“The process of self-representation and articulation in public is still the only means through which the civic imagination can be cultivated. The process of articulating good reasons in public forces one to think from the standpoint of others...the ability of individuals and groups to take the standpoint of others into account is a crucial virtue in a civic polity. The public sphere is like the pupil in the eye of the body politic; when its vision is murky, clouded, or hindered, the sense of direction of the polity is also impaired (Silverstone, 2007: 54 quoting Benhabib 2003: 211).”²⁹

This capacity for social empathy (Waisbord, 2009: P. 17)³⁰ is also expressed in CAJ since it represents advocacy efforts to promote social change by understanding and addressing various social issues such as environment, health, gender issues etc. with the intent to contribute to the resolution of these identified social problems.

Furthermore, civic imagination is a term described as directly linked to a human quality which opens the doors to understanding and in turn, the capacity to make judgments in and through the public world. Imagination that is much like the Kantian enlargement of mentality beyond the individual and the solitary self which requires taking the position of the other (Silverstone, 2007: P. 46).³¹

CAJ practitioners may take this up as a personal crusade or they may have been encouraged by their media outfit, or influenced by the agenda of non-profit civic society movements or social development organizations. Whatever it is that prodded them to engage in CAJ

²⁹ Ibid

³⁰ Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

³¹ Roger Silverstone, *Media and Morality: On the Rise of the Mediapolis*: Cambridge: Polity Press. 2007.

practice, the idea is to contribute to the betterment of society by taking the posture of “being a part of that society”.

With the professionalization of media programmes of civil society movements and engaging media practitioners into their agenda, remarkable changes have taken place in the over-all media landscape of the global south. More and more social mobilizations are taking place to tap media to address various social concerns such as health, domestic violence, environment, immigration, poverty and so on and being reported in both mainstream and alternative media (Waisbord, 2008: pp. 378 - 379).³²

However, Waisbord noted that CAJ practice may not be as extensive as it should be practiced in the media industry. He also noted some misunderstandings on the characteristics of CAJ within the industry which resulted to a deficient quality of news coverage of social problems. He linked this deficiency to a key failure of the press in supporting democratic goals (Waisbord, 2009: P.10).³³ He substantiated his claim with the following assertion:

“First, the press does not expand the boundaries of public debate concerning social problems. By turning away from covering a wide variety of problems, the press excludes citizens and issues from the process of critical reflexivity. In doing so, the press perpetuates a process of social exclusion by relegating only the concerns of majority. Second, the absence of coverage of social inequities reflects the disinterest of the press to foster empathy and solidarity in democratic life. Studies have documented that social problems that affect the poor are typically absent in the news (Waisbord, 2009: PP. 10 - 11).”³⁴

This exclusion theory is still very much prevalent in many parts of the world and needs to be further addressed as in the case of Latin America where even with uninterrupted democracy throughout the region, media democratization is still pending (Waisbord, 2009: P.7).³⁵ To achieve this, collaboration between the press and civil society must be strengthened. This is

³² Waisbord, Silvio, 2008. Advocacy Journalism in a Global Context. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, pp. 371–385, New York: Routledge.

³³ Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

³⁴ Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

³⁵ Ibid

made possible if the press effectively functions as a platform for the expression of citizens' interests (Waisbord, 2009: P.5).³⁶

Yet CAJ is also considered as a follower of established journalistic routines and norms such as the preference for the official, dramatic, conflict-laden, sensationalist and celebrity/event-triggered coverage. As such, standard media logic is still very much present in CAJ stories. But CAJ attempts to introduce breakthroughs and cuts a creative edge to the stories. (Waisbord, 2009: P.11 and 16).³⁷

CAJ presumes that media as a whole will always chase special interest stories and therefore, it is important to find opportunities in shaping media content. Through CAJ, civic entities can influence news making for the benefit of society's greater good including programs for the disadvantaged sector such as food banks for the poor and projects for the disabled (Waisbord, 2009: P.17).³⁸

In terms of media forms, the journalistic quality of CAJ reports are quite similar to the style and form used in typical media reports. Moreover, these works are considered as CAJ primarily because of the theme and emphasis of the stories and not the form on which it was written. Media content may vary and change depending on the relations between news organizations and external factors. The challenge lies on how to recognize prospects, identify strategies and opportunities for content diversification. Opportunities for a good coverage may be reporting the human side of certain stories such as scientific breakthroughs, judicial decisions or finding fresh angles in high profile speeches, congressional debates or commemorations (Waisbord, 2009: P. 12, 18).³⁹

To sustain the efforts of civil society groups in bringing the media into the fold of social causes, they provide trainings to familiarize journalists with social and civic issues and bring the journalists in contact with social development experts and other information sources (Waisbord, 2009: P.13).⁴⁰

³⁶ Ibid

³⁷ Ibid

³⁸ Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

³⁹ Ibid

⁴⁰ Ibid

It must also be realized that our understanding of the application of CAJ forms and concepts cannot be standardized for general use in all situations. There are distinct characterisations and nuances based on the specific conditions of each country or region which are intermittent in most cases.

There are local situations that are more favourable to the practice of civic advocacy journalism than others such as in localities where international development organizations and civil society groups are already active. (see also Waisbord, 2008: P378).⁴¹ The presence of these groups may be quite limited or even restricted in other geographical areas and this situation may not favour CAJ practice.

There is also that element of unpredictability in the turn-out of media content. It is in this frame that Silverstone brought forth the notion of “unbearable lightness of being” by Milan Kundera to impart the message that media content and representations is fleeting and cannot be counted on to exist for a long time (Silverstone, 2007: P. 50).⁴²

This fleetingness and changeability in character contributes to the blurred distinctions and often overlapping properties that we see in many media forms and media content around us. Attempts to set rigid parameters and rules of practice may turn out to be counterproductive instead of enabling specific media systems to take its course, evolve and grow. Taking its course does not mean total lack of intervention but giving ample space to define and transform itself with the changing external influences.

Finally, CAJ is focused on societal reforms and engages collaboration with civil society groups but it is not similar or can be equated to critical and activism-oriented media movement within the dominant media. CAJ is not premised on a radical critique of the dominant media nor is it antagonistic with other industry groups and practitioners (Waisbord, 2009: P.14).⁴³

⁴¹ Waisbord, Silvio, 2008. Advocacy Journalism in a Global Context. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, pp. 371–385, New York: Routledge.

⁴² Roger Silverstone, *Media and Morality: On the Rise of the Mediapolis*: Cambridge: Polity Press. 2007.

⁴³ Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

To summarize the foregoing CAJ concepts and forms according to Waisbord and its corresponding link to the Media and Morality's concepts of Silverstone, I have constructed the following table of summary points.

Table 1
Summary of the Connectedness of CAJ and Media and Morality

Waisbord's CAJ Concepts and Forms	Silverstone's Media and Morality Concepts and Principles
- socio-political and socio-economic conditions in human life are addressed and presented in CAJ	- there is a mediapolis where media can be a designated place for civility, humanity and responsibility
- there is collaborative effort between advocates of civil society movements and the media	- there are endless possibilities for media space in the fulfilment of social, civic and moral accountabilities
- primarily connected to the principle of social development and social change adopted by international social development organizations and civil society groups	- reporting on the social conditions of human life is practising the profession with a conscience, a case of media and morality at work
- this type of journalism produces stories on social issues like climate change, gender inequality, poverty, among other social concerns	- the new moral agenda is creating a space for media hospitality, obligation and judgment that requires attention to media justice

Waisbord's CAJ Concepts and Forms	Silverstone's Media and Morality Concepts and Principles
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the role of the journalist is crucial in shaping public opinion, policy and governance around the world where journalists take stands and present their perspectives on social issues 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - emphasizes that journalists should look into their conscience and morality as they report on global events and its impact on society - the multiple roles of the media as actor, spectator and narrator accomplishes history and makes the polis a productive place to organize memories
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - utilizes mainstream and alternative media organizations as outlet for news and analysis 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - this calls for a media space that foster social and civic understanding, media fairness and integrity instead of the usual apathy among media practitioners
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -carries a global hindsight and perspectives in its reportage. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - inclusivity rather than exclusivity in media coverage - increasing global incomprehension and inhumanity calls for a sustained level of humanity
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the media plays a central role in recognizing the rights of social development stakeholders through the politics of recognition 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - there is a need to apply the concept of media democratization with an accommodating stance in journalistic reportage

Waisbord's CAJ Concepts and Forms	Silverstone's Media and Morality Concepts and Principles
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the capacity for social empathy is expressed in the efforts to promote social development through reportage of social issues and with the intent to contribute to the resolution of these issues 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - civic imagination is the process of articulating good reasons in public and forces one to think from the standpoint of others...the ability of individuals and groups to take the standpoint of others into account is an essential virtue in civic polity
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the journalistic quality of CAJ reports are quite similar to the style and form used in typical media reports. But these works are considered as CAJ primarily because of the theme and emphasis of the stories and not the form on which it was written. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the principle of media and morality may be adopted by journalists to set the tone of the theme and content in their stories
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - CAJ presumes that media as a whole will always chase special interest stories and because of this, it is important to find opportunities in shaping media content. - the challenge in CAJ lies on how to recognize prospects, identify strategies and opportunities for content diversification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - there is always the element of unpredictability in the turn out of media content. Silverstone brought up the notion of "unbearable lightness of being" by Milan Kundera to impart the message that media content is relative and cannot be expected to remain the same for a long time.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - CAJ practice is considered as a follower of established journalistic routines and norms such as the preference for the official, dramatic, conflict-laden, sensationalist and celebrity/event-triggered coverage 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - media in any form could serve as a venue for amplifying social concerns. These social concerns are depicted in the principle of media and morality.

Waisbord's CAJ Concepts and Forms	Silverstone's Media and Morality Concepts and Principles
<p>- civil society groups bring the media into the fold of social causes by providing trainings that would familiarize journalists with the social issues and bring them in contact with social development experts and other information sources</p>	<p>- the idea of civic imagination in media and morality engages the media to empathize with others, to look beyond the self and out into the larger society with a sense of social responsibility and obligation</p>
<p>-there are local situations that are more favourable to civic advocacy journalism than others such as in localities where international development organizations and civil society groups are already active</p>	<p>- a “mediapolis” is a space that is shared and shareable within a localized or a globalized setting. There are certain factors that allow or disallow media to be shared</p>

4.2 News and Analysis

The significance of this sub-section lies in the analytical design of this research. Since the methodology I used is a qualitative content analysis of both news and analysis articles, I deemed it necessary to provide this introductory description on the difference between news and analysis reportage.

My review of literature on the basic difference of news and analysis reportage produced a surprising result. I found that there was very little materials written on this subject. What I found was a small write-up of comparison by George Miller saying that “news is an information about recent and important events while analysis is an investigation of the component parts of a whole and their relation in making up the whole (WordNet, Princeton University).⁴⁴

⁴⁴ George Miller in WordNet, Princeton University. (<http://wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn>)

In practice, the basic understanding of journalists on what constitutes news is that of a journalistic report that responds to the four Ws and one H in journalism (why, where, when, who and how). It's basically a media report that narrates a situation, profile or event and telling it like it is. However, this too allows some degree of subjectivity in reporting as details in the choice of sources, quotation used, title, specific angle of the story is still subject to the personal disposition of the journalist. In form however, it is still considered as news or straight news as it is called in professional parlance.

Analysis, on the other hand uses a more personal voice as it lends a conclusive and analytical viewpoint on a given situation, profile or event. However, it may not be deficient in objectivity as the article could be substantiated with the necessary facts to lay down the basis of the concluding remarks and analysis of the journalist. Yet in form, we might conclude that it is an analysis feature on account of the writing style and presentation.

Given these distinctions, we can deduce that the subjective vs. objective divide in journalism is not as rigid as we see it today. Media forms are constantly transforming and this transformation is evident in current journalistic pieces produced. Similarly, media forms are also evolving analogous to media consumption patterns.

One can say that the subjective/objective divide with its current blurred distinctions has lost its once "cast on stone" prominence and is headed towards the direction of becoming immaterial and a non-issue.

4.3 Mainstream and Alternative Media

For this research, I have also reviewed materials on the difference of mainstream and alternative media since the articles in the content analysis were classified as either produced by the mainstream or alternative media sources. In practice, CAJ is fostered by both media types.

By comparison, there were certainly more materials on this subject than what was found in news and analysis.

Waisbord underscored the need to spotlight issues and feature voices that are typically ignored in the mainstream media. The mainstream media as a strategic ally in the struggle to promote changes is valued largely for its reach and influence in affecting the decisions of policymakers (Waisbord, 2008: P. 377-378).⁴⁵

Mark Deuze promoted the bridging of the gap between the mainstream and alternative media and supported Gillmor's (2004) notion that journalists are more effective as facilitators and moderators of community level conversations rather than as top-down storytellers. Deuze asserted the value of the kind of journalism that engages the reader as fellow citizens rather than as potential customers. Deuze also cited Lasica (2003) who described an emerging trend of a journalism that is participatory and who underscored the symbiotic nature of evolving relationships between the mainstream and grassroots news media (Deuze, 2005).⁴⁶

Deuze calls on journalists to think of the public as co-creators of the stories they write and to bridge the gap between the public and media practice (Deuze, 2005).⁴⁷ He called attention to this gap that should be filled with mechanisms of continuous merging, converging and synergizing (citing McChesney, 1999, Maatschappelijke, Ontwikkeling, 2003).

By and large, mainstream media refers to the traditional media machinery built on a large media enterprise such as national daily papers and television as well as radio broadcast networks. Sometimes, media corporations operate as a tri-media with radio, television and newspaper operations, including online presence. These large-scale operations along with media professionals running the operations and guided by corporate media strategy constitute what is known as the mainstream media since the production of news and features is directed towards the general public with the intent to gain monetary profit.

Alternative media often refers to small scale operations of community-based publications or blogs and websites that sometimes cater to specific target audience.

Publishing journalistic stories in the mainstream media is usually much more costly compared to those in the alternative media but the returns in investment through advertisements,

⁴⁵ Waisbord, Silvio, 2008. Advocacy Journalism in a Global Context. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, 371-385, New York: Routledge.

⁴⁶ Deuze, Mark, Towards Professional Participatory Storytelling in Journalism and Advertising, *First Monday Volume 10*, July 2005.

⁴⁷ Ibid

marketing and even subscriptions is also expected to be much bigger in the mainstream media.

On the objective-subjective divide, mainstream media is expected to produce objective news pieces. But this level of expectation is not accorded in the same way to alternative media which is expected to be more subjective in the treatment of stories. Yet however, this objective-subjective divide in both mainstream and alternative media remains a contentious subject as some academics have already debunked the relevance of this divide (for instance, Ward, 2008: P.302)⁴⁸

4.4 Notes on Subjectivity

Promoters of objectivity in journalism may not see CAJ as objective enough to fulfill the basic requisites of journalism practice. To some extent, CAJ is subjective reporting or in journalistic parlance, biased reporting. Biased towards reporting of social issues as manifested in the subjective choice of topic, story angle, story thread and use of sources.

For many CAJ practitioners the subjective, objective divide is treated as immaterial and a non-issue since they regard form as a mere support of the substantive content. Although form is still widely observed in CAJ practice, it is the actual story that prevails over the form and manner of reportage. In Stephen Ward's "marketplace of ideas", it is choosing the best and the fittest.

Stephen Ward identified three major complaints about objectivity in media. First, objectivity is too big an ideal for journalism and hence is a myth, second, objectivity even if possible is undesirable because it forces journalists to use restricted formats, it encourages superficial writing of "official" facts, it fails to provide readers with analysis and interpretation, objectivity ignores other functions of the press such as commenting, complaining and acting as a public watchdog, Finally objectivity restricts a free press. A democracy is better served

⁴⁸ Ward, Stephen J.A. Journalism Ethics. 2008. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, 295-309. New York: Routledge.

by a non-objective press where views compete in a marketplace of ideas (Ward, 2008: P.302).⁴⁹

5. METHODOLOGY

In this section, I will explain my choice of methodology for this study which is a *qualitative content analysis*.

This master's thesis offers an empirical perspective of CAJ and its practice on the ground. Through a selection of online print media reports on the CCCS (in the form of news and analysis, in both mainstream and alternative media), this thesis depicts CAJ practice through a qualitative researcher's lens.

It must be noted that with the application of a qualitative content analysis as a methodology, this paper is not purported as a statistical representation nor as a showcase of the over-all trend in CAJ practice. This is because the variables and indicators around a particular situation or event may vary accordingly and thereby warrants a fresh review of perspectives with each context and backdrop analysed.

5.1 Why Content Analysis?

As a social science method, content analysis is an empirically grounded method, exploratory in process, and predictive or inferential in intent (Krippendorff, 2004: p. xvii). These empirical enquiries have become the backbone of communication research. (Krippendorff, 2004: pp. xviii, 1).⁵⁰

Content analysis is a research method that may be used to examine any piece of writing or occurrence of recorded communication and as such, content analysis is used in a large number

⁴⁹ Ward, Stephen J.A. Journalism Ethics. 2008. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, 295-309. New York: Routledge.

⁵⁰ Krippendorff, Klaus. 2004. *Content Analysis: An Introduction to its Methodology* (2nd edition). London: SAGE Publications.

of fields, ranging from marketing and media studies, to literature and rhetoric, ethnography and cultural studies, gender and age issues, sociology and political science, psychology and cognitive science, as well as other fields of inquiry (Klippendorff, 2004: pp. xviii, 1).⁵¹

Some of the early recorded content analysis studies in media include: 1) The 1929 US economic crisis with its ensuing social and political problems where many Americans believed that mass media was partially to blame for the breakdown of cultural values; 2) the onset of the new media and how it has affected other media types such as radio and television and 3) how the new media is linked to the political challenges in a democracy (Klippendorff, 2004: p. 6).⁵²

Content analysis is also able to predict or infer phenomena that cannot be directly observed but is enough just with interpreting written text (Klippendorff, 2004: p. 10).⁵³

The scope of content analysis as a social science method was further explained by B. Devi Prasad in his paper *Content Analysis: A Method in Social Science Research* (Prasad, 2008: P. 7).⁵⁴ where he underscored the importance of content analysis in advertisements in newspapers and magazines to draw useful inferences on national culture as well as media preferences of advertisers (Prasad, citing Auter and Moore, 1993; Wang, 1996:).

To Prasad, various media forms offer a rich source of materials for content analysis where scholars have examined changes in social roles and behavioural patterns to understand and characterise various social phenomena by analysing its contents and messages (Prasad, 2008).⁵⁵

The method itself has not one single established formula but the important benchmark is to be able to come-up with meaningful patterns that could substantiate one's findings and conclusions according to set objectives. For as long as the basic framework is there which consists of the following: a body of text on which to begin an analytical effort, a research question that the analyst seeks to answer, a context within which to make sense of the body of

⁵¹ Ibid

⁵² Ibid

⁵³ Ibid

⁵⁴ Las Das, D.K.and Bhaskaran, V. (eds.). (2008) *Research Methods for Social Work*, New Delhi: Rawat, pp. 173-193.

⁵⁵ Prasad, P.7

text, an analytical design, inferences that answer the basic questions as well as a valid and justifiable course of the research (Krippendorff, 2004: 29-30).⁵⁶

5.2 Why Qualitative?

The qualitative method is advantageous in many respects. It provides historical and cultural insights over time, allows alternate of specific categories and relationships, and provides an unobtrusive means of analyzing textual interactions. (Mike Palmquist et. al., 2005).⁵⁷

Many established researchers have followed the path of qualitative research as in the case of Klaus Krippendorff who questioned the validity and usefulness of the distinction between quantitative and qualitative content analyses. “Ultimately, all reading text is qualitative, even when certain characteristics of a text are later converted into numbers” (Krippendorff, 2004: p. 16).⁵⁸

Using a qualitative research method such as the content analysis involves appreciating the interpretive implications where the researcher can take a position in observing institutional settings. In qualitative research, both the description of the social reality that is construed by the researcher and the meanings that the researcher might assign to the descriptions vary on their observational and analytical standpoints. (Silverman, 1997).⁵⁹ This is the same standpoint that Benhabib referred to on Arendt’s “civic imagination” (Silverstone, 2007: P.54).⁶⁰

Following this description of social reality, qualitative research as articulated by Silverman allows for an ample subjective interpretation in qualitative social science research. As such,

⁵⁶ Krippendorff, Klaus. 2004. *Content Analysis: An Introduction to its Methodology* (2nd edition). London: SAGE Publications.

⁵⁷ Carol Busch, Paul S. De Maret, Teresa Flynn, Rachel Kellum, Sheri Le, Brad Meyers, Matt Saunders, Robert White, and Mike Palmquist (2005). *Content Analysis, Writing@CSU*. Colorado State University. Department of English. May 11, 2010 from <http://writing.colostate.edu/guides/research/content/>.

⁵⁸ Krippendorff, Klaus. 2004. *Content Analysis: An Introduction to its Methodology* (2nd edition). London: SAGE Publications.

⁵⁹ Silverman, David. 1997. *The Logic of Qualitative Research*. In *Context and Method in Qualitative Research*, eds. Miller, Gale and Dingwall, Robert, 13-25. London: SAGE Publications.

⁶⁰ Roger Silverstone, *Media and Morality: On the Rise of the Mediapolis*: Cambridge: Polity Press. 2007.

there appears to be much tolerance if not preference for subjective analysis even in the field of media (see Ward, 2008: P.302).⁶¹

6. ANALYTICAL DESIGN

Following the identification of the methodology that will be applied in this study which is a qualitative content analysis, the unit of analysis used was a selection of 40 online CAJ articles produced on the CCCS. This consisted of 20 news pieces and 20 analysis features and a combination of both mainstream and alternative media (refer to *Appendix 2* for the brief description of the media outfits). For my research, the empirical ground was the sample (40) articles on the CCCS.

Why did I chose 40? I believe that this amount of articles would produce a fairly significant quality of reports that would capture a substantial representation of CAJ forms at the CCCS in both news and analysis writing in both mainstream and alternative media.

Through a content analysis of online works of print journalists both in the mainstream and alternative media produced from the Summit, this thesis shall identify the forms and representations of civic advocacy journalism in climate change reporting, particularly at the CCCS.

The choice of 20 news and 20 analysis was meant to determine the basic difference between these two journalistic types of writing as applied in CAJ reporting at the CCCS. The inclusion of both mainstream and alternative media was intended to ascertain any basic difference of these two kinds of media outlets with regards CAJ reporting at the CCCS.

The articles that were selected were those published during the period December 2009 to April 2010. Most are on-site reports while some post-Summit reports were included as a necessary continuation of the major points discussed, either for establishing the media content or because the articles were written post-Summit.

⁶¹ Ward, Stephen J.A. Journalism Ethics. 2008. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, 295-309. New York: Routledge.

6.1 Selection Criteria

The point of this sub-section is to arrive at a criteria for the selection of the sample articles. The selection process was guided by Waisbord's articulations of the CAJ concepts and forms as well as Silverstone's media and morality theory. These include: representation in both news and analysis forms, representation in the mainstream and alternative media, provides a global perspective on a social concern, contributes to the resolution of climate change problems, and advances the efforts of social development organizations.

It must be noted that the selection of the articles is embedded on the quality of each of the article and not on the media outfit publishing the story. The one thing needed to be established as far as the media outfit is concerned was whether each media company may be considered mainstream or alternative media.

Thus, basing on current CAJ concepts and theories reviewed from academic sources, my qualitative choice of articles were grounded on the following selection criteria:

6.1.1 Representation of both news and analysis

The articles were classified as either news or analysis in terms of the presentation of the story. Press releases issued by the organizers appearing in its website were not included in the content analysis since press releases do not qualify as a journalistic piece. For this research purposes, a piece of news story or analytical feature is far more credible and influential than a stand alone press release.

6.1.2 Representation in both alternative and mainstream media

In this content analysis, I wanted to identify any difference or comparison of CAJ practice in the mainstream and alternative media. Were there differences in the manner of reportage or in the treatment of the stories in the articles which could contribute to a clearer understanding of the forms of CAJ practice at the Summit?

6.1.3 Depicts important highlights at the CCCS

This refers to focal points such as major decisions that were arrived at in the Summit or newsworthy incidents at the Summit that when taken together represent the entirety of the CCCS.

These highlights of the Summit include important outcome from the crucial meetings and accounts of side events that merit public attention. It could also include major declarations and statements from stakeholders and interest groups.

6.1.4 Provides a global perspective on the climate change issue

Even if the story is country-specific, there would still be that global perspective in the presentation of the story. If this is considered, the article becomes more relevant and attuned to a bigger readership. This is also in connection with the concept of a holistic CAJ practice underscored by Waisbord's and Silverstone's idea of a globalized space – the notion of “think globally act locally” in action. Thus, the articles chosen managed to present the larger picture in every story.

6.1.5 Contributes to the resolution of climate change problems

As highlighted by Silverstone's concept of media obligation and responsibility to society, the course to take in CAJ is to contribute to the resolution of climate change issues and concerns. This stance would be visible in the articles.

The motive in CAJ as articulated by Waisbord is to help deepen our understanding of social issues and problems so that ultimately, it would contribute to the resolution of these problems. One such social issue is the environmental problem called climate change. With the track that CAJ is taking as a branch of journalism, it is expected to contribute to the resolution of this particular environmental problem that greatly affect societies across the globe. Reporting on pertinent information on how climate change is being addressed as a social problem is a step forward in that direction.

6.1.6 Advances climate change efforts of social development organizations

One glaring characteristic of CAJ is the emphasis on the crucial role of media in resolving social issues in collaboration with social development organizations and civic advocacy groups. This collaboration takes the form of either featuring the programs and agenda of these organizations or getting them as news sources in journalistic reportage. These efforts should be perceived in the articles.

6.2 Clustering of Ideas

For the analysis, I will use the concept of clustering ideas derived from Krippendorff's method of conducting content analysis where big chunks of data are broken down to smaller chunks to make the process of analysis more manageable.

Klaus Krippendorff created a design in coming up with an analytical framework in a qualitative content analysis which requires subdividing data into smaller thematic units. Krippendorff reached an inference on the achievement motive of subjects (citing McClelland, Atkinson, Clark and Lowell 1992) by searching statements of goals assertions of individuals. These researches characterized the individuals in the study as having needs or motives. The rearticulation of any part of a story in these terms constitutes a thematic unit (Krippendorff, 2004).⁶²

In clustering of ideas, Klippendorff stressed the importance of “forming perceptual wholes from things that are connected, belong together, or have common meanings. Procedurally, the clustering is done by lumping together objects, attributes, concepts, or people according to what they share and dividing sets of these entities into classes whose boundaries reflect difference between them” (Klippendorff, 2004: p. 208).⁶³

⁶² Klaus, Krippendorff. 2004. Content Analysis: An Introduction to its Methodology (2nd edition). London: SAGE Publications.

⁶³ Ibid

Krippendorff attested to the popularity of clustering in content analysis because “it is based on intuitively meaningful similarities among units of analysis, and its resulting hierarchies resemble the conceptualization of text on various levels of abstraction” (Krippendorff, 2004: p. 210).⁶⁴

For this study, I will apply this concept of clustering to arrive at the findings and analysis of this qualitative content analysis by identifying CAJ components in the sample articles and clustering them according to the content and emphasis of the angle and story thread.

These clusters of various components that will be derived from the 40 articles will form the major text in the findings and analysis of this study.

7. FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

The following section which presents the findings and analysis of this study begins with the presentation of the sample articles.

The selection of the articles was based on a conceptually informed choice of what would constitute a good representation of CAJ works produced at the Summit. The selection criteria was guided by articulations of CAJ forms and representations in academic materials reviewed, primarily the concepts of Waisbord and Silverstone’s principle of media and morality.

The articles were also classified according to whether these were published in a mainstream or alternative media outfit and whether these are more considerably news or analysis in form and presentation of story.

There were 40 articles in the selection: 20 news pieces, 20 analysis features and a mix of both mainstream (26 articles) and alternative (14 articles) media publication. In a subjective sense, these articles constitute a reasonable representation of CAJ practice at the Summit, and perhaps to some extent, of current CAJ practice in general.

⁶⁴ Klaus, Krippendorff. 2004. *Content Analysis: An Introduction to its Methodology* (2nd edition). London: SAGE Publications.

In my findings and analysis, I will identify the underlying CAJ component or components of each article based on the principle of clustering by Klippendorff .

The findings also include an analysis on how the aspects of news and analysis formats as well as the mainstream and alternative media aspects were applied in the articles. The gender perspective and the journalists' standpoints in the articles were also included as significant findings of the study.

The following table (Table 2) is a complete list of analysed articles including the author's name, date of publication, media outfit, journalistic category, media type, and the CAJ component or components which I have identified in each of the articles. There is also a brief description of these media outfits in Appendix 2 of this report.

7.1 Classification of the 40 Articles

Table 2
Sample Articles

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
1. “Factbox: The Copenhagen Accord and Global Warming”, compiled by Alister Doyle, Editing by Dominic Evans, March 31, 2010	Reuters	News	Mainstream	Social and Environmental Impact of Climate Change; <u>overlaps with</u> Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord
2. “Bangladesh Most Affected by Climate Change” by Maruf Mallick, December 8, 2009	bdnews24.com (Bangladesh Online Newspaper)	News	Mainstream	Country/Region Concerted Action and Efforts on Climate Change
3. “Cameroon Assesses Participation” by Godlove Bainkong, January 14, 2010	Cameroon Tribune	News	Mainstream	Country/Region-specific Action and Efforts on Climate Change
4. “India Boosts Climate Data Contribution to IPCC” by T. V. Padma, February 5, 2010	scidev.net	News	Alternative	Country/Region-specific Action and Efforts on Climate Change

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
5. “Developing Nations Want 2011 Climate Pact Deadline” by Wendell Roelf, April 25, 2010.	Reuters	News	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-setting on the Climate Change Accord
6. “Bicycle-Friendly Copenhagen a Model for Big Cities” by Henriette Jacobsen, December 14, 2009	Reuters	News	Mainstream	Good Practices in Curbing Climate Change
7. “Environmental Group Introduces “Climate Wizard” Database, December 15, 2009	ScienceCodex (sourced from University of Washington)	News	Alternative	Good Practices in Curbing Climate Change
8. “Tens of Thousands Stage World's Largest Climate March in Copenhagen” By Ben Ferguson and Jonathan Owen, December 13, 2009	The Independent	News	Mainstream	Citizens’ Protests and Voices in the Summit
9. “Climate Protesters Maintain Hunger Strike” by Michael Simire, December 17, 2009	Climate Change Media Partnership	News	Alternative	Citizens’ Protests and Voices in the Summit

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
10. “African Countries Back Funding Proposals” by Dave Opiyo, December 16, 2009	Daily Nation	News	Mainstream	Country/Region-Concerted Action and Efforts on Climate Change; <u>overlaps with</u> Funding Mechanisms in Implementing the Climate Change Accord
11. “CLIMATE CHANGE: UN to Mobilize Funds for Developing Nations” by Daniel Stahl, February 15, 2010	Inter Press Service	News	Alternative	Funding Mechanisms in Implementing the Climate Change Accord
12 “Copenhagen Accord Climate Pledges Too Weak: UN” by Alister Doyle and Gerard Wynn, April 1, 2010	Reuters	News	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
13. “Climate Chief was Told of False Glacier Claims Before Copenhagen” by Ben Webster, January 30, 2010	The Sunday Times	News	Mainstream	Political and Organizational Controversies Surrounding the Summit
14. “UN Climate Chief Rajendra Pachauri Got Grants Through Bogus Claims” by Jonathan Leake, January 24, 2010	The Sunday Times	News	Mainstream	Political and Organizational Controversies Surrounding the Summit
15. “Climate Pact Appears Increasingly Fragile; UN Official Quits” by Juliet Eilperin and Steven Mufson, February 19, 2010	Washington Post	News	Mainstream	Political and Organizational Controversies Surrounding the Summit
16. “West Mediterranean Countries Unite on Climate Change”, April 26, 2010	Agence France Presse	News	Mainstream	Country/Region Concerted Action and Efforts on Climate Change
17. “Beware of Carbon Trading Warp Warn Activists” by Claudia Ciobanu, December 8, 2009	Inter Press Service	News	Alternative	Implementation Mechanisms of the Climate Change Accord

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
18. “Youth Delegate Provides Face of Climate Change” by Matelita Ragogo, December 16, 2009	Pacific Islands News Association (PINA)	News	Alternative	Citizens’ Protests and Voices in the Summit
19. “Copenhagen Closes with Weak Deal that Poor Threaten to Reject” by John Vidal and Jonathan Watts, December 19, 2009	The Guardian	News	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord
20. “Copenhagen Climate Summit: Deal Agreed Amid Chaos” by Alistair Jamieson and Louisie Gray, December 19, 2009	Telegraph	News	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord
21. “Why did Copenhagen Fail to Deliver a Climate Deal?” by Richard Black, December 22, 2009	BBC News	Analysis	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord
22. “Copenhagen Climate Accord: Key Issues” by Richard Black, December 19, 2009	BBC News	Analysis	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
23. “Sticking Points at Copenhagen Summit” by Darryl D’ Monte, December 14, 2009	InfoChange India News and Features	Analysis	Alternative	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord
24. “Copenhagen Climate Summit: If Not An Agreement, At Least A Deal” by Nava Thakuria, January 1, 2010	News Blaze	Analysis	Alternative	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord
25. “Political Theater Warms up Copenhagen Climate Summit” by Robert Bridge, December 15, 2009	RT	Analysis	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord
26. “Europe Bypassed on Climate Summit” by James Canter , December 1, 2009	New York Times	Analysis	Mainstream	Political and Organizational Controversies Surrounding the Summit
27. “Summit is Seen as US Versus China” by Jeffrey Ball, December 14, 2009	The Wall Street Journal	Analysis	Mainstream	Political and Organizational Controversies Surrounding the Summit

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
28. “Climate Talks Near Deal to Save Forests” by Elizabeth Rosenthal with contribution from John M. Broder, December 15, 2009	New York Times	Analysis	Mainstream	Implementation Mechanisms of the Climate Change Accord; <u>overlaps with</u> Funding Mechanisms in Implementing the Climate Change Accord
29. “Six Hurdles to Delivering Climate Finance” by J. Timmons Roberts, February 11, 2010	Scidev.net and IIED	Analysis	Alternative	Funding Mechanisms in Implementing the Climate Change Accord
30. “With Dragon Woman Out, Philippine Climate Team Loses Teeth” by Patricia Faustino, January 31, 2010	Climate Change Media Partnership	Analysis	Alternative	Country/Region-specific Action and Efforts on Climate Change; <u>overlaps with</u> Political and Organizational Controversies Surrounding the Summit

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
31. “Biodiversity Loss Matters and Communication is Crucial” by David Dickson, February 5, 2010	Scidev.net	Analysis	Alternative	Social and Environmental Impact of Climate Change; <u>overlaps with</u> Media Development
32. “Copenhagen Accord: Questions and Answers by Louise Gray, December 19, 2009	Telegraph	Analysis	Mainstream	Implementation Mechanisms of the Climate Change Accord; <u>overlaps with</u> Funding Mechanisms in Implementing the Climate Change Accord
33. “Covering Climate Change” by Ben Block, March/April 2010 Issue	Worldwatch	Analysis	Alternative	Media Development
34. “Climate Debate Gets Ugly as World Moves to Curb CO2” by David Fogarty, February 17, 2010	Reuters	Analysis	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
35. “Media Melee at Copenhagen” by Darryl D’ Monte, December 19, 2009	InfoChange News and Features	Analysis	Alternative	Media Development
36. “Independent Journalists Denied Access to Copenhagen Climate Talks” by Alex Kelly, December 7, 2009	Investigate West	Analysis	Alternative	Media Development
37. “Copenhagen Media Coverage: A Perfect Storm” by John Vidal, December 7, 2009	The Guardian	Analysis	Mainstream	Media Development
38. “Many Goals Remain Unmet in 5 Nations’ Climate Deal by John M. Broder, December 18, 2009	New York Times	Analysis	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord
39. “Low Targets, Goals Dropped: Copenhagen Ends in Failure” by John Vidal, Allegra Stratton and Suzanne Goldenberg, December 19, 2009	The Guardian	Analysis	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord

40 Articles	Publication	Journalistic Category	Media Type	Civic Advocacy Journalism Component
40. “Copenhagen Summit Ends in Blood, Sweat and Recrimination” by Andrew Gilligan, December 20, 2009	Telegraph	Analysis	Mainstream	Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord

7.2 CAJ Components in the Sample

Based on Klippendorff’s concept of clustering used as an analytical tool for this qualitative content analysis (refer to subsection 6.2 in this paper), I have identified nine CAJ components which I derived from 40 sample articles. These CAJ components refer to the angle or the strongest dent of each of the articles.

These CAJ Components in the articles are:

1. Policy Agenda-Setting on the Climate Change Accord
2. Country/Region Concerted Action and Efforts on Climate Change
3. Political and Organizational Controversies Surrounding the Summit
4. Funding Mechanisms in Implementing the Climate Change Accord
5. Media Development
6. Citizens’ Protests and Voices in the Summit
7. Implementation Mechanisms of the Climate Change Accord
8. Good Practices in Curbing Climate Change
9. Social and Environmental Impact of Climate Change

The summary of the components in the 40 sample articles were presented in table form in this section (see 7.2.2 , Table 3).

Following is my analysis of the nine components that I have identified from the sample articles and explained herein according to the over-all ranking/dominance of the components in the articles:

1. Policy Agenda-setting on the Climate Change Accord

This is the most written about CAJ component with 14 articles that carry this as a storyline and angle. The policy agenda-setting refers to the manner on which policy agenda are discussed, deliberated and agreed upon at the Summit. For example, what issues and processes were involved, what were the policy interests at stake, who were the interest groups or stakeholders, what political conflicts arose in the negotiation process.

This is not a surprising finding as some of the journalists covering the Summit have already expressed in their articles that they went to Copenhagen expecting to write about major agreements. Although writing about the social and environmental impact of climate change is valued for its paramount importance and should also be given ample media space, they also realized that the Copenhagen Summit at that point in time was one big negotiating table where major policy agreements were expected to be reached.

Some of the articles with this component include: a report on the details of how the Copenhagen Accord was arrived at amidst numerous objections (Article 1), a report describing the climate pledges in the Copenhagen Accord as being too weak (Article 12), an analysis on why the Copenhagen Summit failed to deliver a climate deal (Article 21), an in-depth discussion on the key issues of the Copenhagen accord (Article 22) and a look into the factors that ended the summit in “blood, sweat and recrimination” (Article 40).

2. Country/Region Concerted Action and Efforts on Climate Change

This component refers to localized national or regional efforts and concerns to combat climate change. The keyword is concerted which means that the action or effort has gone through some discussions and agreements at the policy-making level of a country and/or geographic

region. The high ranking of this component suggests that there was a great deal of effort in getting more national and geographical representation as possible in areas where the impact of climate change is at its worst. These countries include Bangladesh, Myanmar, Honduras, Vietnam, Nicaragua, Haiti, India, Dominican Republic, the Philippines and China.

There were six articles which carried this component which was ranked no. 2 in the order of dominance in the 40 articles. The CAJ message of this component implores the notion: think globally, act globally and if not now then when?

The content of the six articles with this component show that many of the gravely affected countries have arrived at some degree of concerted action and that somehow, there are already ongoing localized efforts to curb the effects of climate change. The articles with this component namely articles 2, 3, 4, 10, 16, and 30 also reflect the assessment of the representatives from these countries on the turn-out of the Summit events as well as some local perception on their country-specific needs in dealing with the problem of climate change.

3. Political and Organizational Controversies Surrounding the Summit

This component was focused on the controversial and sensational happenings at the Summit, many of which involve government leaders and prominent personalities.

With another no. 2 ranking at 6 articles, this is also a well covered CAJ component with reports about controversies ranging from the resignation of the UN's top climate official just two months after putting together the Summit (Article 15) and a reported unscientific claim on the melting Himalayan glaciers by the IPCC, winner of the Nobel Peace Prize 2007 Award (Articles 13 and 14). Other controversial stories include Europe Being Bypassed in the Summit as China and the US seek to set the rules of the negotiations (Article 26), and the Summit turning into a political spectacle between China and the US, the two biggest gas emitters in the world (Article 27).

This is a well covered component on account of the conflict-angle that standard media practice usually follow. Article 30 portrays a country-specific case of politicking among the

ranks of anti-climate change advocates and how this might affect a country's (the Philippines in this case) standing in the anti-climate change global agenda. Article 27 outlines the context and the implications of the Summit being seen as a "US versus China" event, notwithstanding the fact that these two countries have major roles in the UN climate agreement.

4. Funding Mechanisms in Implementing the Climate Change Accord

"Follow the money" is usually a standard lead in investigative and analytical stories and the Summit is no exception to this journalistic precept. This is another well covered component with 6 stories and also ranked no. 2. Stories with this component revolved around fund sourcing, financial transparency, financial monitoring systems, and questions on what constitute climate finance or whether this is loan or grant (Article 29 for example). Journalists are faced with this huge task of going through thick layers of financial information as a lead for potentially good CAJ stories.

Other stories with this component include: African countries backed proposals to "establish a 30 billion US dollars start-up funds to enable them to plan for ambitious programmes to tackle climate change in the next three years" (Article 10) and a report on "UN moving forward to mobilize funds for developing nations and help these countries cope with the worst impact" (Article 11).

5. Media Development

Media development as a major theme in the 40 articles is part and parcel of the coverage at the Summit wherein journalists gave certain attributions to the process of gathering and writing climate change stories. It is this component that tackles media reportage at the Climate Change Summit. Ranked no. 3 with 5 articles focused on media development, the articles are the journalists' appraisal of media processes at the Summit including their own participation. The articles highlighted the need for more sophisticated and more effective media strategies in climate change reporting and issued reminders such as avoiding the "apocalyptic tone" of reporting on climate change and concretizing scientific jargons to more comprehensible terms (Article 31).

To share valuable lessons and perhaps to vent out some frustrations, some journalists narrated their own experiences covering this high profile event. Many have also used the first person reporting style.

Journalists affiliated with both mainstream and alternative media expressed their assessment on the Summit in their articles: Caught in frenzy, a journalist recounted his experience:

“pity the mainstream press. Their choice is stark: stay outside the Bella Center, pay £6 for a cup of tea and cover rallies, demonstrations and fringe meetings in the freezing cold; or keep warm inside, pay £7 for tea and asphyxiate in the hot, poisonous air generated by armies of diplomats and non-government groups.”
(Article 37)

In the preceding quote, the journalist described the tension at the Summit with this implicit message: as a media professional, one cannot simply absorb the situation. His message may be connected to Silverstone’s articulation on the multiple roles of a media practitioner as actor, spectator and narrator (refer to Silverstone citing Kristeva, 2001: PP- 53 – 54).⁶⁵

In the following narrations, it is evident in the article that this journalist is also affected by the turn of events as a global citizen affected with a global issue.

“I met several journalists under pressure to provide constant negotiation updates and remain competitive with the multitude of news sources reporting on the very same story. Although many sources were available to them for interview, short deadlines and tumultuous reporting environment created several logistical challenges.” (Article 33)

“Running from one place to another took time and effort, and some of the side events that were held in the city were difficult to get to – too much was going on.” (Article 33)

⁶⁵ Roger Silverstone, *Media and Morality: On the Rise of the Mediapolis*: Cambridge: Polity Press. 2007.

“Media observers read dozens of stories and found not too many analysis that explained how the climate talks would affect the global environment. The stories mostly reflected “classic journalism norms of drama between negotiating countries.” (Article 33)

The journalist who wrote article 33 has shown that journalists covering big political events like this are likewise confronted with their own issues and concerns. But while they may have issues that are professional by nature, they too were enmeshed in the same problems that confronted the same events. For example, the lack of resources, the disorganization and misinformation, and issues of public accountability and responsibility.

Despite these pronouncements, it can be said that the journalists at the Summit (all 40 articles) reported on the reality of climate change with urgency and conviction. There was not one who upped a sceptical voice on the reality of climate change. For the journalists, climate change is a matter that must be dealt with serious response. And even if the Copenhagen weather was a freezing cold winter at the time of the Summit, they were well aware that climate and weather must not be mistaken as one and the same - an indication of their adeptness on the issue.

6. Citizens' Protests and Voices on the Summit

High profile meetings like this especially when there are critical decisions to be made almost always attract a throng of protesters. A protest may be a news but the manner of dispersing a protest and facing up to the protesters is oftentimes an even bigger news. In the case of the Summit, protesters were as huge as tens of thousands. Some foreign protesters were deported and hunger strikes were staged. This component is ranked no. 4 in the order of dominance with only 3 of the 40 articles focusing on this story. The citizens' critical edge is always a welcome story but this is also where new opportunities for packaging media content may be taken up. In this case, the journalists reporting this story worked on it in pointedly and incisively by bringing out the crucial issues instead of focusing on the drama (take for example Articles 8 and 9).

Beyond the protests, citizens' voices especially that of the youth rendered a refreshing take to an otherwise normative treatment of the issue. At the Summit, the voice of the youth was represented and heard clearly (Article 18).

7. Implementation Mechanisms of the Climate Change Accord

As recounted in the articles, the most important document that was produced at the Summit is the Copenhagen Accord, an agreement drawn by a small group of state leaders. Out of the 40 articles, there were 3 stories written on this component with a number 4 ranking of dominance. The articles focused on how the Accord is to be implemented, how it would monitor compulsory gas emission cuts by wealthy nations and install voluntary mitigation efforts by developing countries. As these two action points is finance-driven, this component in the 3 articles also overlaps with the funding mechanism component.

The main difference of this CAJ component from the funding mechanism component is that this refers to actual project implementation that is over and above the financial aspect. It could involve the installation of monitoring and evaluation system, setting-up of a viable management information system (MIS) or building a coordination network. This low ranking may be attributed to the fact that since the Copenhagen Accord is yet to be officially implemented at the time of this study, there is not much to report on this aspect so far. Furthermore, without the necessary implementing mechanisms in place, there are no concrete program of actions to report and make public, so far.

Some of the articles with this component include: a report on a “warning issued by environmental groups that by pushing carbon offsetting and trade, governments of developed countries are bypassing their responsibility to significantly reduce domestic emissions” (Article 17); a “sweeping deal that would compensate countries for preserving forests and other natural landscapes that play a crucial role in curbing climate change” (Article 28).

8. Good Practices in Curbing Climate Change

There's always the other side of the coin, so to speak. In this case, the feel good and inspiring side of a story. The Summit is no exception. Not all stories produced at the Summit are highly charged and conflict-laden. Some stories carry goodwill, hope and inspiration. Just by looking around the Copenhagen neighbourhood, it occurred to one journalist just how environmentally sustainable the city is by building its infrastructures around a bike city and encouraging more people to abandon the idea of using their cars even in the cold winters (Article 6). There is also a news about a scientific breakthrough – a web tool that generates color maps of projected temperature and precipitation changes using 16 of the world's most prominent climate change models. This is being considered for use on such occurrence as habitat shift, an important radar to save the environment and its habitat (Article 7).

In the area of dominance, this component is ranked lowest at no. 5 with only 2 articles written about it. This low rank may be attributed to the notion that this component is not considered a timely, breaking news story in the Summit, though not an unimportant one either. More than anything else, journalists attended the event for the policy decisions and the anticipated highly charged political exchanges.

9. Social and Environmental Impact of Climate Change

This is a CAJ component that tackles the adverse environmental and social impact of climate change. In these articles, the peril of climate change is explained in terms of temperature rise, greenhouse gas emissions and the crucial contribution of deforestation and biodiversity measures to combat climate change.

This component is the least written of all the components. Ranked lowest at no. 5 with only two articles, this component is seen as a continuing saga and is not considered an urgent agenda in the Summit. Considered urgent matters to cover were the high profile decisions made by state leaders at the Conference of Parties (COP) and not explanatory pieces on the effects of climate change. As far as the journalists at the Summit were concerned, these

adverse effects are a given. The Summit was seen as a venue to raise the discussions in terms of concrete policy-level action.

It is usually in this component where the “apocalyptic tone” in climate change reporting is evident and for the journalists covering the event, this is the time to momentarily set this aside and attend to other more pressing concerns. One journalist conveyed, “I think the time for the alarms is in the past. We have come to the Summit for a decision” (Article 33).

7.2.1 Overlapping Components

As conveyed in the preceding analysis of the nine components, there were palpable points of convergence and interconnectivity within the components. Because of this, it follows that there were overlap of components in some of the articles. These overlap have been observed in articles 1, 10, 28, 30, 32.

Specifically, Article 1 has both social and environmental impact and policy agenda-setting components, Article 10 has a country/region-specific action and efforts that overlaps with funding mechanisms, Article 28 has both the implementation mechanisms that overlaps with funding mechanisms, Article 30 has a country/region-specific action and efforts that overlaps with political and organizational controversies surrounding the Summit, and Article 32 has both implementation mechanisms and funding mechanisms components.

The following table (Table 3) summarizes the rankings and order of dominance as well as the overlap of the components in the 40 articles.

7.2.2 Summary of Dominance and Overlap of CAJ Components

Table 3
Ranking of CAJ Components

Ranking of CAJ Components	40 Articles
1. Policy Agenda-setting on the Climate Change Accord Rank no. 1	Arts. 1, 5, 12, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 34, 38, 39, 40 (Total 14)
2. Country/Region-specific Action and Efforts on Climate Change Rank no. 2	Arts. 2, 3, 4, 10, 16, 30, (Total 6)
3. Political and Organizational Controversies Surrounding the Summit Rank no. 2	Arts. 13, 14, 15, 26, 27, 30 (Total 6)
4. Funding Mechanisms in Implementing the Climate Change Accord Rank no. 2	Arts. 10, 11, 28, 29, 32 (Total 6)
5. Media Development Rank no. 3	Arts. 31, 33, 35, 36, 37 (Total 5)
6. Citizens' Protests and Voices in the Climate Change Summit Rank no. 4	Arts. 8, 9, 18 (Total 3)

Ranking of CAJ Components	40 Articles
7. Implementation Mechanisms of the Climate Change Accord Rank no. 4	Arts. 17, 28, 32 (Total 3)
8. Good Practices in Curbing Climate Change Rank no. 5	Arts. 6, 7 (Total 2)
9. Social and Environmental Impact of Climate Change Rank no. 5	Arts. 1, 31 (Total 2)
OVERLAPS	Articles 1, 10, 30, 31 and 32

7.3 Mainstream and Alternative Media

In the content analysis, there was an attempt to balance out the selection of media type but considering the existence of other criteria for the selection of the 40 articles, the best that this study can come up with is a total of 26 articles from the mainstream media, and 14 articles from the alternative media.

It is hard to say whether the bigger representation of mainstream media in this content analysis study is a reflection of the actual population size of legitimate mainstream media companies compared to alternative media outfits. There are no available data that could support this statement. However, this considerably bigger selection of mainstream media may be attributed to the fact that the Summit was more “friendly” towards mainstream media practitioners. Resources is also a critical factor that may be attributed to this outcome.

In the guideline for media accreditation, it may be deduced that alternative media were not as welcome to attend the Summit as the mainstream media had been. The accreditation process (see media accreditation, 3.3.3) favoured the presence of mainstream media practitioners. This was also expressed by an alternative media practitioner (refer to Article 36) questioning the organizers on their failure to include his alternative media outfit in the accredited list.

In the media accreditation guidelines, it specifically stated that only bona fide media organizations will be accredited. The Secretariat's decision not to entertain accreditation requests from information outlets of non government organizations practically left out a sizeable not for profit alternative media groups. In terms of resources, alternative media may not even have the resources that the mainstream media outfits can usually mobilize to enable them to cover high profile events. They were in a way disenfranchised in the process. Media disenfranchisement goes against the principle of media democratization, a term used by Waisbord to connote equal rights of expression and access in media. (Waisbord, 2009: P7).⁶⁶

Yet, given this challenge faced by the alternative media in covering the Summit, their contribution still turned out to be quite productive for themselves as practitioners, for their outfit, and to some degree, for CAJ practice. They were productive in the sense that they have contributed their journalistic stories to society's understanding of the climate change issues despite the limitations on resources of usually non-profit or small-scale enterprise alternative media.

In the content analysis, both the mainstream and alternative media practitioners have gone beyond the normative style of journalistic reporting and took it upon themselves to inject a certain voice and standpoint to achieve a common good although in varying degrees.

In the turn-out of the articles, the mainstream media produced more news pieces than analysis (14 against 12 of the total 26 articles produced by mainstream media) while the alternative media produced more analysis pieces than news pieces (8 against 6 of the total 14 articles produced by alternative media).

⁶⁶ Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

This goes to show that despite limited resources, the alternative media practitioners made the most of their coverage by ensuring that the standpoints in their articles were clear and discernible and were thereby inclined to produce more analytical pieces instead of news pieces.

In the articles, it was evident that there was a strong complementation of the mainstream and alternative media in bringing out what were otherwise contentious issues like the policy agenda of major players at the CCCS. This complementation is evident in the finding that there were more alternative media practitioners writing analytical pieces and more mainstream media writing news pieces. Instead of looking at the difference in a competitive light, it might be seen instead as means of supplementing the difference where it might be lacking.

7.4 News and Analysis

In the 40 articles, there were 20 news pieces and 20 analysis pieces.

From the news pieces, the CAJ components discerned according to ranking/dominance were:

Rank no. 1

- country/region concerted action and efforts with 5 articles
- policy agenda-setting on the Climate Change Accord with 5 articles

Rank no. 2

- citizens' protests and voices in the Summit with 3 articles
- political and organizational controversies surrounding the Summit with 3 articles

Rank no. 3

- good practices in curbing climate change with 2 articles
- funding mechanisms in implementing the Climate Change Accord with 2 articles

Rank no. 4

- social and environmental impact of climate change with 1 article
- implementation mechanisms of the Climate Change Accord with 1 article

In the order of dominance, news pieces carried the components on country/region concerted action together with policy agenda-setting as the most dominant components, followed by citizens' protests and voices alongside political and organizational controversies surrounding the summit. This was followed by good practices in curbing climate change together with funding mechanisms components. The lowest ranked components were the social and environmental impact of climate change along with the implementation mechanisms component.

This implies that the descriptive news focused more on identifying the country-based or regional efforts in curbing climate change its policy-agenda setting. This also means that discussing the country-based or regional efforts entail looking at policy considerations which requires situating it in its operational and geographic base.

For the analysis features, the CAJ components and its specific ranking/dominance were reported as follows:

Rank no. 1

- policy agenda-setting with 9 articles

Rank no. 2

- media development with 5 articles

Rank no. 3

- funding mechanisms with 3 articles

Rank no. 4

- implementing mechanisms with 2 articles

Rank no. 5

- country/region concerted action and efforts with 1 article
- social and environmental impact of climate change with 1 article

This means that the analysis articles focused more on the policy-agenda setting and the political and policy-level processes at the Summit. This also means that the journalists brought up the discussions and debates in the Summit towards its policy-making dimension and implications. Even if it means taking a politicized standpoint where they saw fit.

In summary, the **basic comparison** in the treatment of news articles and analysis features in the articles are the following:

1) The content analysis showed that there were subject matters better processed as news while there were subject matters more suitable with analytical presentation. It was the subjective call of the journalist to present the story according to what may be considered its best structure. Again, as articulated by Waisbord, what makes a story a CAJ story is its content and message and not the structure on which it was delivered. In CAJ, the content and substantial message takes precedence over the form and structure.

2) Both news and analysis gave the answers to the 4 Ws (what, where, when, who) and 1 H (how) in basic journalistic reporting. But the analysis form had gone beyond this by providing the why of the story, the context and background, as well as recommendatory postures in the articles. It does not mean that focusing on the 4 Ws and 1 H completely wipes out the standpoint of the journalist in the article. The standpoint factor may be inculcated in varying degrees such as lesser degrees for some CAJ practitioners and more intensely by others. Although the presence of a standpoint was explicitly mentioned in the academic articles. It is in this content analysis study where the varying degrees of intensity in standpoints in CAJ reporting was identified. This is another finding in CAJ forms and representations that goes beyond what was identified from relevant academic literatures reviewed.

3) In the articles, the news were descriptive and usually shorter in length while the analysis is usually longer. Content wise, the analysis were usually longer because of the stronger standpoint factor of the journalist in the article. The journalists writing the analysis features

also made the effort to present and deliver the message more thoroughly and comprehensively to ensure deeper understanding by the readers.

In this content analysis, the standpoint of the journalist was an important tool in getting the content and the message across. However, a CAJ article to qualify as such does not entirely depend on the strength or intensity of the standpoint. In the articles, the strength or intensity of individual standpoints cannot be standardized because it comes across in varying degrees. Aside from the standpoints, there were other factors and considerations (as articulated by Waisbord), which create CAJ stories.

7.5 Journalists' Standpoints on the Summit

In the analysed articles, the CAJ practitioners made no fuss about injecting their own standpoints on the Summit. The articles indicated a low level of success on the outcome of the Summit. The question on whether the Summit's goals was achieved or not is actually the main question that was brought forth and answered in the articles analysed.

To substantiate their claim on the outcome of the Summit, the CAJ practitioners compared the goals of the Summit to what has actually taken place.

The Summit with 192 country representatives in attendance was convened in order to arrive at some crucial agreements on how to implement anti-climate change measures globally. The major decision points included: compulsory reduction cuts by wealthy nations, voluntary mitigation action by developing countries, and climate fund commitments to support anti-climate change programmes globally.

CAJ journalists articulated in their articles that this was not achieved as projected. What came out of the Summit was a loose agreement of 29 countries in a document called "Copenhagen Accord". The Accord was controversial in the light of protests and questions coming from other countries. There was a question on whether the target in global warming limit should be pegged at 1.5 degrees instead of the 2 degrees stipulated in the Accord (Articles 5, 10, 18 and 19). There was also a question on how much reduction in gas emissions were the developed nations willing to meet (Article 38). In terms of climate finance, questions on fund sourcing,

the nature of the fund and its monitoring mechanisms were also not clearly defined even if in principle, there was a sizeable financial commitment made by the US President to the Climate Fund. The journalists reported that other than these open-ended agreements, the Summit was also swamped with clandestine negotiations, power play and a lot of mistrusts among the major players namely the US, China and the EU. Many countries were reported to have been left out in the negotiation process (Articles 21, 26, 40). EU, wanting a more participatory and democratic process was reported to have been snubbed in the process when the US and the BASIC countries went ahead with the framing of the Copenhagen Accord. BASIC is a group of heavy carbon-emitting developing countries. It is composed of Brazil, China, India and South Africa.

The over-all impression one can get from the 40 articles is that the Summit although potentially successful in what it has embarked to do, is a big let down for many if not most of the participants. For many, it had been a chaotic and a not so well organized event. Others considered it a good beginning but way below the set target.

In such a divisive situation, the media became a part of the melee (Article 35) and journalists participated by making visible their stands in the debates. For example in Article 32, there was a US-China tiff regarding monitoring requirements on climate finance where China regarded these monitoring requirements as a security threat. In such hotly contested issues, journalists have taken sides.

Some frustrations were evident on their perceived roles as news bearer in the Summit. A journalist's observation of the Summit goes:

“What all first timers to the UN climate process may find hard to grasp at Copenhagen is that this could be the only mass media event in history without a proper beginning or an end, which has no genuine celebrities, no fixed agenda, no guaranteed outcome and is unlikely to throw up clear winners or losers.” (Article 37).

7.6 The Gender Perspective

The requisite to mention the gender perspective in this thesis lies on the claim of gender equality advocates that there is inadequate gender-equality perspective and women's role signification at the Summit. Moreover, in the course of the selection of articles for this study, there were no articles found that specifically tackled the gender issue at the CCCS. Similarly, of the journalists who wrote the 40 articles, a good majority are male journalists. According to Waisbord, the gender equality perspective is usually taken up as a part of CAJ practice (Waisbord, 2009: p.379).⁶⁷ This was not the case at the Summit.

Various international efforts to safeguard gender equality and women's participation in all development processes have been going on in the last few decades. As such, a gender-based reportage at the Summit can use as resource the many international legal instruments that have been framed and signed by member states in various policy framework conventions. These conventions were meant to ensure the legal stature of international laws that promote gender and equality as well as ensure women's participation in all development processes.

One major policy agreement on media and gender was formulated at the 4th World Conference on Women in Beijing in 1995. The Section J of the Beijing Declaration of Action ratified by UN's member states highlights the need to 1) increase the participation and access of women to expression and decision-making in and through media and news technologies of communication; and 2) to promote a balanced and non-stereotyped portrayal of women in the media⁶⁸ (source: Division for the Advancement of Women at UN's Department of Economic and Social Affairs).

Another binding international agreement among UN member States is the commitment to the attainment of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), a global partnership to reduce extreme poverty with time-bound target deadline in 2015. Two of the identified 8 targets include: to ensure environmental sustainability (Goal 7) and to promote gender equality and

⁶⁷ Waisbord, Silvio, 2008. Advocacy Journalism in a Global Context. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, pp. 371–385, New York: Routledge.

⁶⁸ <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/platform/media.htm>

empower women (Goal 3).⁶⁹ As these two targets coincide, it is important to look at implications on gender equality when analysing media output at the Copenhagen Climate Change Summit.

The Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO), a global advocacy NGO monitoring the UNFCCC process and advocating for sensitive climate change policies came up with its statement online titled "Gender and Climate Change at Copenhagen COP-15: WEDO's perspective on a History –making Year".⁷⁰

The WEDO report pointed-out that gender equality is a prerequisite for both sustainable development and poverty eradication and is thus an indispensable component for a comprehensive and just climate change negotiations. Yet, the Copenhagen Accord, the final product of the Summit, vaguely reflected these comprehensive components according to the WEDO Report. "It contains a meagre emissions target, has optional pledges to finance adaptation and mitigation projects and lacking a mechanism to manage the pledges. Moreover, the Accord does not include the social language much less the gender equality texts".

The WEDO report noted that there were around 30% women registered country delegates and that some of the policymakers working on their country-specific texts managed to impart some awareness on the acute vulnerability of women to climate change and emphasized the importance of gender-responsive global climate change framework. Yet however, media has not particularly picked up these gender perspectives in their output.

7.7 Summary Analysis

This sub section provides the summary analysis of the forms and representations mentioned in the findings. It provides a more pointed presentation of CAJ aspects found in the articles.

Based on the articles, the role of CAJ at the Summit was to raise awareness to generate public knowledge about climate change and inform the general public about institutional agreements

⁶⁹ <http://www.unmillenniumproject.org/goals/gti.htm>

⁷⁰ http://unfccc.int/files/press/news_room/statements/application/pdf/090203_speech_dehli.pdf

on climate change. The presence of journalists also served as a pressure point for the heads of States to deliver. CAJ practice has also generated some degree of transparency in forging international agreements at the Summit.

The CAJ works were intensive and extensive documentation on how the Summit transpired. Journalists who wrote the articles developed their stories around the different layers of the climate-change talks. Most of these stories delved on the policy angle, many on the economic and financing angle, while some managed to highlight the scientific basis of climate change and its manifestations. There was also the effort to look more closely into the local implications of the climate change issue and its various social aspects.

Improving CAJ Reportage

There were useful insights shared by CAJ journalists on how the coverage of climate change may be developed. For example, one journalist underscored the need for concretizing concepts and avoiding the use of apocalyptic tone in reportage as follows:

“In the analysis category, effective communications strategy in climate change could fall into identified pitfalls such as lacking concreteness of concepts in the content or rendering an apocalyptic tone which could promote cynicism or apathy” (Article 31).

The convergence of various media outlets to advance media democratization is crucial in CAJ practice. The inevitable role of traditional media and technology in bringing together various media outlets was noted in the following:

“In all likelihood, traditional news sources will continue to report the news. The largest print, broadcast, and radio news organizations will survive their current crisis by learning to profit from an online medium. The question is whether their reincarnation will provide sufficiently detailed reports, especially on international issues, in an increasingly complicated, interconnected world. Many more environmental news groups will emerge” (Article 33).

“Technology must advance to meet the needs of our digital dependencies. Social media help us better select what information we want to receive. But we should be wary of becoming closed from unfamiliar ideas and knowledge sources. Trusted sites such as online newspapers should help by becoming curators of other reliable websites” Article 33).

CAJ cultivates the practice of continuing education of all stakeholders within a story from the journalists to the readers and those at the receiving end of a particular story. This inclination was manifested in one journalist’s vision:

“We all must be better educated. We don’t only need better, more educated journalists, we also need better, more educated readers. And climate change coverage need to have more in-depth, international coverage” (article 33).

Such a statement underscored the concept of media responsibility and accountability which is translated into how journalists give credence to the value of self education. In the process, education will have a better impact on their work output. It is also in this way that their readers become a part of the education continuum.

Selecting News Sources

The news sources tapped by the CAJ practitioners range from government officials, international development organizations, civil society groups or NGOs, the scientific and academic community, the business community, the arts and culture community with movie celebrities and supermodels voicing out their stake on the issue.

It is not unusual that in a high profile and fast-paced international coverage, the journalist’s choice of materials and sources is sometimes limited to what and who is accessible and available. The choice of sources likewise contributed to the quality of the report. Despite this limitation, the journalists tried to inject a balanced representation of stakeholders even if in the final analysis, the journalists would mostly impart their predominant individual stand towards an issue.

Journalism Styles and Media Content

In terms of journalistic style, the normative and standard style of reporting and framing media content were adhered to. Take for example the conflict-laden and celebrity/event-triggered stories (refer to Waisbord, 2009: p. 378).⁷¹ But opportunities for content diversification also emphasized by Waisbord (Waisbord, 2009: P. 18)⁷² were also evident in some of the reports. In the case of media development stories, the journalists' use of subjective personal narratives rendered credence to the development of the story and imparted their message directly to the readers. This use of personal narratives by the journalists is one characteristic of CAJ found in this study that has not been previously mentioned in academic materials.

The personal voice was more obvious in the analytical features rather than in the news pieces.

Media content is another variable that can change depending on the fluctuations of external factors within the media landscape (Waisbord, 2009: P. 18).⁷³ Thus, editorial policy also played a part in the kinds of stories produced.

Thus, the forms and representations found in CAJ reporting at the Summit connected quite well with the concepts and theories found in the academic literature.

Connecting CAJ Theories to Practice

The following points summarize the connection of CAJ theories to practice in terms of its forms and representations at the Summit. Academically, the theories and concepts used were those of Waisbord's CAJ concepts alongside Silverstone's theory or principle of media and morality.

⁷¹ Waisbord, Silvio, 2008. Advocacy Journalism in a Global Context. In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, 371-385, New York: Routledge.

⁷² Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

⁷³ Ibid

Operates in a globalized mediated space that is both shared and shareable (Silverstone theory and concept)

The mediated space here specifically refers to the interventions set by international social development organizations including the UNFCCC in resolving the climate change issue. These interventions may take the form of climate change programs and actions that were identified at the Summit. These include interventions that could make an impact to the world no matter how big or small it is. Its shared and shareable factors allowed room for creativity and opportunities to achieve its intentions and set objectives.

The prominence of social development orientation and approach in CAJ reportage (Waisbord theory and concept)

This finding was premised on the realization that CAJ practitioners at the Summit played a central role in recognizing the broad members of society in their reports. In this case, media assumed the role of advocate against climate change. This was addressed to society at large but particularly to those who are most affected, the most challenged, the least privileged and most marginalized sector of society who have the least means to protect themselves from the adverse effects of climate change. CAJ practitioners at the Summit advanced a social cause that could contribute to the upliftment of the disadvantaged because improving their lot leads to the attainment of a common vision for social progress.

This is Silverstone's concept of advocacy for humanity, civility, responsibility and morality which are tied to the social development approach of CAJ where CAJ is the medium and its social development orientation is the fuel that activates it.

The pro-active role of international development organizations in tapping media participation (Waisbord theory and concept)

In practice, international development organizations like the UNFCCC Secretariat encouraged media (more mainstream media in the case of the UNFCCC Secretariat) to apply CAJ

concepts in their reports as well as raise awareness on various social issues and infuse this in their works.

The series of media workshops organized by the UNFCCC surfaced this proactive role of social development organizations to engage the journalists in sustained CAJ Reporting. The collaborative venture of these organizations with the media was also evident in the support provided at the Summit such as equipment and IT support, organized press conferences and facilitation of interview sessions with news sources (see media support, 3.3.2).

Adoption of media's normative approach to reporting but still allows room for content diversification (Waisbord theory and concept)

As observed in the articles, the standard, normative approach to journalistic writing still abound in CAJ although a space for creativity and flexibility was also applied at the Summit. The use of personal narratives style of reporting or the way stories were packaged with visuals in the form of photography are only some examples of the creativity displayed.

This visualization in the form of photography depicts the reality of the social issue in question. In some cases, photojournalists are assigned to visually capture social realities to supplement and enhance the journalists' reports while in other cases, the journalist had to double-up as a photojournalist.

Evolution in media forms and processes was also observed with regards CAJ practice at the Summit. For example, the use of newer and up to date media technology in gathering materials, or in the evolving process of story identification and news generation. Given the basis of its existence, CAJ is the type that would promote evolution or change in media processes.

Injecting a compounded view over a fragmented view in the stories that journalists write (Silverstone theory and concept)

CAJ stories at the Summit attempted to present the bigger picture that would provide the context and important backdrop of a story. This is because to be considered effective, CAJ stories should invoke a certain level of understanding and humanity, empathy and sensitivity. This often requires an in-depth and comprehensive approach to storytelling. As a case in point, the analytical pieces in the content analysis were more empathetic in the manner that these were written because of the surfacing of compounded views over fragmented views.

Grounded on a moral space that fosters media hospitality, responsibility, obligation and judgment (Silverstone concept and theory)

This characterization of CAJ was evident in the articles. The judgments or political stands were overtly visible in most analytical features and in some of the news pieces. This begs the question, would a journalist's strong judgment or political stand be a requisite in CAJ stories?

Based on the content analysis, a political stand using a personal voice makes an affective CAJ story. It would be difficult to escape a judgment or political stand, or for that matter, a value-free media reportage in any of the CAJ stories. Be it a news or analytical piece, a standpoint in a CAJ story is identifiable. The difference lies on the volume or strength of the personal voice. Is the journalist making a strong statement or is there an attempt to tone down the voice. By its basic principle to advocate change and introduce policy reforms in society, CAJ reporting at the Summit produced relatively clear and audible voices.

Inclination towards inclusivity and accommodation rather than exclusivity in the selection of story angles and sources (Waisbord concept and theory)

CAJ reporters at the Summit covered a wide range of stories. As journalists they may have been aware of the potential of a small incident, observation, statement or event that when picked up could turn out to be a powerful story. An angle was then chosen for the packaging and over-all presentation of the story. Because CAJ is inclusive and accommodating on probable story sources, there was a wide variety of newsworthy stories to write about.

This is media democratization in action where getting a balanced view from the broader population ensured a more solid reportage. But with all the press releases made about gender equality and women's equal participation, the gender concern was not addressed in any of the stories. Genuine democratization in journalistic reporting reflects the widest base of representations possible including those that are gender- based.

Using a self-introspection and personal approach in writing CAJ stories (not previously found in the academic materials reviewed)

The self-introspective writing approach seems to be gaining ground in CAJ reporting even from the mainstream media. At the Summit, most of the articles with a media development component used a personal voice to essay their beliefs and personal stand. This writing style is no less effective than a third person approach and even made the reportage more credible and convincing.

Importance of timeliness in CAJ stories (Waisbord theory and concept)

This finding may be connected with the discussion on standard journalism practice since news or analysis in general must take into consideration the factor of timeliness. However in the case of CAJ coverage of the climate change issue, there was a need to further emphasize the element of timeliness in the articles.

Most of the articles emphasized the message that time is of essence in this whole debate because “nature does not negotiate” citing UN Secretary General Ban-Ki Moon in his opening speech at the Summit (Source:Mongabay.com).⁷⁴ This message of timeliness of reportage is a basic journalism precept that CAJ practitioners at the Summit were conscious of. By and large, the relevance of a CAJ story is also judged according to its responsiveness to the needs of the times.

⁷⁴ http://news.mongabay.com/2009/1215-hance_ban.html

Utilizes both mainstream and alternative media organizations as news outlet
(Waisbord theory and concept)

The complementation of the mainstream and alternative media outlet in publishing the CAJ articles contributed to the over-all media output at the Summit. Based on the content analysis, mainstream media practitioners were inclined to write more news stories while alternative media practitioners wrote more analytical features.

In terms of institutional support and resources for coverage, the mainstream media at the Summit had been more privileged in these regard.

With these distinctions, it is best to note the collaboration points of these two types of media outfit instead of looking at it from the perspective of rivalry or competition. With both mainstream and alternative media's online accessibility, the space for democratization with these two media forms was significantly widened. Given this, the question of distinction no longer lies on whether the story was published by a mainstream or by an alternative media organization. Rather, the question of distinction as far as the CAJ articles at the Summit is concerned is: what is the content and message of the story?

The importance of both news and analysis forms was established in the articles
(Waisbord theory and concept)

As far as CAJ reportage at the Summit is concerned, both forms are useful tools in bringing across the messages and standpoints in the stories. The basic distinction lies on the finding that news stories were more descriptive in its approach while analysis pieces were more comprehensive and explanatory in presentation. There was also a seemingly stronger standpoint in analysis on account of the bigger opportunity to inject subjective opinions in analysis pieces. This is the reality of varying degree of intensity in standpoints between news and analysis articles that were found in the study.

The abovementioned concepts, forms and representations of CAJ that were found in the articles captured the core and foundation of what CAJ is about as a type of journalistic practice. But given the reality of media evolution, CAJ's relevance is hugely dependent on

the context it covers. Without a full understanding of its context, media itself becomes the impediment in its role as informant and communicator for social processes.

In the final analysis, it may be stated that CAJ as a development-oriented type of journalism was active in disseminating the climate change concern. CAJ practitioners were able to relay to the world the need for a competent policy formulation, strong political will and effective governance when it comes to curbing or reversing the greenhouse effect and greenhouse gas emissions in the atmosphere.

CAJ practice in this case was also clear in its position that media can only do so much in spreading the social development agenda. The rest of it has to come from key actors and stakeholders, civil society groups, various government institutions and from each and every citizen who comprise the larger society who are at the receiving end of this environmental problem.

8. CONCLUSIONS AND DISCUSSIONS

The selected and analysed articles are comprehensive and multi-faceted in scope but still fall under the basic tenet and realm of civic advocacy journalism – that of contributing to the understanding of a social problem, dissecting it and presenting the larger picture. Most of the articles did not stop at simply describing this social problem but also prescribed solutions to the climate change issue in the context of the Summit. The bottom line was the presentation of the article in such a way that the journalist was able to provide a clear description of what actually happened and also produced an insightful reportage.

This study found that in the articles, there was not a single attempt to negate the legitimacy of climate change as an important social concern. For these journalists, it is a given that climate change as a social problem must be understood in all its dimensions be it scientific, technical, political, economic, cultural so that in the end, it will not have a deleterious impact on humanity and their habitat.

It is also important to note that CAJ practitioners did not regard themselves as the mouthpiece of the Summit Secretariat or the Summit itself. Although there could be many collaboration points, in the end, it was still the call of every journalist to report on what was deemed fit.

Basing on the theoretical basis of CAJ the principle of media morality that were conceptualized by Waisbord and Silverstone respectively, it may be said that although the Summit was considered short of expectations as pronounced in many of the articles, CAJ practice was successfully carried-out. The “mediapolis” with its globalized space was well covered according to the range and scope of the 40 articles.

The inclusion of both mainstream and alternative media in the CAJ reports also reinforced its inclusive characteristic. It captured the citizens’ means of expression which is integral to civic mobilization around life-changing social concerns as stipulated by Waisbord (Waisbord, 2009: P. 13).⁷⁵ The complementation of both alternative and mainstream media in bringing forth social issues was also evident in the articles.

This merging of international development organizations, civil society groups and CAJ practice manifested a common cause that extended to the realization of the intent in CAJ reportage at the Summit. In ensuring that the event will be covered extensively by the media, the push was provided by the civil society groups and international development organizations. With the kind of media support provided to journalists both in terms of equipment and facilitation in news sourcing, it was a push of encouragement that may not be present in media coverage elsewhere. Furthermore, citizens’ participation rendered the critical voice in CAJ practice at the Summit although the active participation of other sources was also taken into account. CAJ practitioners were able to tap willing, critical and apparently credible sources that facilitated the writing process.

There were different variables that went into the framing of each of the CAJ stories. Whether these variables were political, cultural or geographical, a profound understanding of the interplay of various social factors were made visible in the stories but mostly in the analysis

⁷⁵ Waisbord, Silvio, 2009. Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America, *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21

features. Similarly, a clear grasp of the situation whether this is at the community, national or global levels facilitated the process of storytelling for the journalists.

Media integrity entailed being able to capture the different nuances of specific localities and situations as illustrated in the articles. In this regard, the complete package were best presented with the use of visuals. Visuals mainly in the form of photography enhanced the quality and relevance of the stories and did not blur or overshadow it.

The overlap of components in the articles was a demonstration of the holistic and systemic treatment of the stories as observed in the interconnected angling and presentation of the story thread. Instead of regarding it as a minor distraction, CAJ practice at the Summit produced comprehensive stories especially with analysis pieces.

The concepts, representations and forms of CAJ were also substantially captured in this content analysis. The CAJ forms and representations found in this study were basically the same as those manifested in the academic materials reviewed. However, there were other CAJ forms and representations found in this study that have not been previously manifested in the academic materials reviewed.

These other CAJ forms and representations identified in this study and were discussed at length in the findings and analysis section of this paper include:

- 1) The use of personal narratives as an effective CAJ form
- 2) The distinct characterization of news and analysis format in CAJ reporting.
- 3) The supplementary function of both news and analysis format in CAJ practice with each format supplementing the other
- 4) Comparative view of mainstream and alternative media in CAJ reporting at the Summit
- 5) The complementation perspective not competition of mainstream and alternative media in addressing social concerns through CAJ

- 6) The varying intensity of journalists' voices in the form of individual standpoints
- 7) The use of visuals in the form of photography as a crucial element in bringing out the content and message in the articles is another aspect of CAJ reportage

On the difference of mainstream and alternative media in CAJ application, this study concludes that both are important outlets for CAJ practice. There was a bias towards the mainstream media as the main conduit in getting across a social development agenda. This was observed in the way the Summit Secretariat handled the media accreditation process with more mainstream media outlets accredited while more stringent rules that were not favourable to alternative media practitioners were applied.

However, the content analysis showed that both mainstream and alternative media can cause the same impact and influence in reporting a particular social development agenda. The impact of the article on the reader might make a difference on whether they are reading a popular media outlet like The New York Times or an unfamiliar alternative media source like the Inter Press Service but most of it depends on other essential factors like the angling of the story, treatment, packaging of media content that makes-up the over-all message of the article.

On the difference of the format of news and analysis, there is not much significant difference if one is predisposed to understand a certain issue in its entirety. Each form complements the other as in the case of the CAJ reportage at the Summit. If one requires a more insightful presentation of the issue in each of the articles, an analysis feature is certainly more substantial. If one is simply looking for a shorter descriptive write-up of an event, phenomenon or product, a news article would serve that purpose. However, if we are to discern the journalist's stand on a particular issue, there is a better chance for it to be revealed in an analytical feature.

Objectivity in news treatment is not a given in CAJ reporting at the summit. This is so because the subjective stance was mostly infused somewhere in the framing and presentation of the story from the choice of story angle, sources for direct and indirect quotes, among other

factors. As far as CAJ reports in the summit is concerned, objectivity in journalism no longer holds its “cast on stone” character that “gatekeepers” in the profession exert to uphold.

On the whole, the fundamentals in CAJ Reporting found in academic materials were exemplified at the Summit such as the essence of the theory and principle of media morality founded on social accountability hospitality, responsibility and judgment, civility, humaneness, fairness, sensitivity and integrity (Silverstone, 2007: 37, 139, 147).⁷⁶ These are values that CAJ practice aspires for and were prominently manifested in the print online works analysed at the Summit.

It must be noted that the relevance of this research lies mainly on the attempt to visualize the theory and concepts in actual practice. Furthermore, it is also relevant in bridging the conventional gap between theory and practice.

With some creativity and space to evolve in, CAJ gained more ground at the Summit. The combined use of mainstream and alternative media venue for CAJ stories created more space for media freedom and expression in covering climate change stories particularly those at the Summit. This shows that media practice is no longer the exclusive turf of a traditional corporate media industry. Media as a venue for information exchange is changing with the times and the context on which it operates. The online phenomenon in news reporting is also radically changing the structure of traditional media publishing with the information highway creating more media space and reinforcing media democratization.

In the light of these transformations in the media landscape, the attendant challenges in CAJ practice in particular and media practice in general are likewise changing. It would serve media practice better if these challenges are recognized rather than ignored. Thus, the need for a periodic assessment of media’s role and its impact on society. Possible research areas for further studies on CAJ include gender-based studies and situational/context analysis of CAJ in various applications. These researches could be made even more relevant by building on existing empirical base or creating new research tracks founded on empirical materials.

⁷⁶ Roger Silverstone, *Media and Morality: On the Rise of the Mediapolis*: Cambridge: Polity Press. 2007

APPENDIX 1

DEFINITION OF TERMS

Adaptation and Mitigation: Refers to the application of green technology to achieve a lower gas emission and keep climate warming at bay.

Civil Society Groups: Mostly non profit, voluntary organizations that tackle social issues and and social problems as professional work.

Climate Fund: Serves as a repository of financial support to capacitate adaptation and mitigation programmes of developing countries. This is a commitment made by developed countries to the anti climate change global agenda.

Climate Justice: A concept that invokes the principles of equality and equity in curbing the climate change problem.

Conference of Parties (COP): Is the governing body that frames agreements and resolutions on the implementation of the Climate Change Convention. Usually attended by high ranking government officials from signatory countries of the Climate Change Convention.

Copenhagen Accord: An agreement made in principle as a result of the Copenhagen Climate Change Summit. This agreement is supposed to serve as a starting point for action towards adaptation and mitigation, gas emission reductions and setting-up of a climate fund.

Global Warming: A phenomenon where the presence of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere increases the temperature in the earth's surface. This has an adverse effect on the environment.

Greenhouse Gas Emissions: Deadly gasses concentrated in the earth's surface that trap heat in the atmosphere. The principal gases that are emitted to the atmosphere because of human activities are: carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous oxide and fluorinated gases. (Source: the Environmental Protection Agency of the US).⁷⁷

UNFCCC – The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) is a treaty with a universal membership. Its objective is to stabilize greenhouse gas in the atmosphere at a level that will prevent dangerous human interference with the climate system. (Source: UNFCCC website).⁷⁸

UNFCCC Secretariat: The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change and the Kyoto Protocol are serviced by the UNFCCC Secretariat also known as the Climate Change Secretariat. (Source: UNFCCC Website).⁷⁹

⁷⁷ <http://www.epa.gov/climatechange/emissions/index.html>

⁷⁸ http://unfccc.int/secretariat/history_of_the_secretariat/items/1218.php

⁷⁹ http://unfccc.int/secretariat/history_of_the_secretariat/items/1218.php

APPENDIX 2

BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF THE MEDIA OUTFITS

This section is a brief description of the media outfit where the articles have been published. Most of the descriptions were derived from the media company's websites.

Reuters is a mainstream news service outfit based in UK. Reuters has won global journalism awards including online journalism awards.

bdnews24.com is Bangladesh' first online newspaper delivered both in Bangla and English. It is a mainstream media outfit.

AllAfrica is a mainstream online news outfit that produces and distributes news across Africa with posts of over 1,000 stories daily in English and French and with over 900,000 articles in its searchable archives.

The Science and Development Network (SciDev.Net) is a not for profit alternative media organization dedicated to providing reliable and authoritative information about science and technology for the developing world. Based in London, Scidev.net works with a pool of freelance journalists to achieve its goal in communicating science.

Science Codex is an alternative media source for science and technology news and information.

The Independent is a UK-based mainstream online newspaper.

The Climate Media Partnership is an alternative online news resource that publishes media coverage of climate change issues in developing countries including reporting on the 2009 Copenhagen Summit.

Founded in 1959, **nation.co.ke** is the electronic edition of Daily Nation, Kenya's leading newspaper and the leading multi-media house in the East African region. It is a mainstream media outfit.

Alternet is an award-winning news magazine and online community that creates original journalism and amplifies the voices of other independent media sources.

The Times is a mainstream online newspaper in the UK. It is also available in broadsheet form.

The Washington Post is a mainstream broadsheet in the US that has been in existence for over a 100 years. It also runs an online format.

Agence France Presse is a mainstream international news agency with its headquarters in Paris, France. It has been in operation since the 1950s.

The **Inter Press Service** is an alternative media news agency that specializes on globalization and development topics. It's considered as civil society's leading news agency.

Green.Pina is the environment reporting division of the Pacific Islands News Association. It is considered as an alternative media.

The Guardian is a mainstream newspaper in the UK which was founded in 1821.

The Telegraph is a mainstream newspaper marketed in the UK and other parts of the world.

BBC News is the internet arm of the British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC), a mainstream media outfit.

InfoChange News and Features is an online resource that provides views, perspectives and debates on crucial issues of sustainable development and social justice in India and South Asia. It is known as an alternative media.

NewsBlaze is an alternative news source based in the US.

RT.com is the online broadcast and print counterpart of the first Russian 24/7 English-language news channel which brings the Russian view on global news. It is a mainstream media.

Online.wsj.com is the online edition of the Wall Street Journal, an international broadsheet based in New York. It is a mainstream media.

nytimes.com is the New York Times' online edition of this mainstream newspaper's news and commentary.

Worldwatch is a research organization that leverages its internet presence and strong network of partners in more than a dozen countries for global impact. Its research is disseminated in over 20 languages through innovative use of print and online media. It is considered an alternative media.

Investigate West is a US based independent, non-profit organization dedicated to the art and craft of investigative and narrative journalism. Investigate West produces and distributes change-making stories about the environment, health and social justice in the Pacific Northwest. It is an alternative media source.

REFERENCES

1. Academic Sources

Bray Robert, *Spin Works: A Media Guidebook for Communicating Values and Shaping Opinions*: San Francisco, California: Independent Media Institute. 2000.

Carol Busch, Paul S. De Maret, Teresa Flynn, Rachel Kellum, Sheri Le, Brad Meyers, Matt Saunders, Robert White, and Mike Palmquist. *Content Analysis*, Writing@CSU. Colorado State University. Department of English. May 11, 2010 from <http://writing.colostate.edu/guides/research/content/>. 2005.

Deuze, Mark, *Towards Professional Participatory Storytelling in Journalism and Advertising*, *First Monday Volume 10*, July 2005.

Elliot, Charles, *Development Debate*, S.C.M. Press, 128 pp., London, 1971.

Gillmor Dan, *We the Media, Grassroots Journalism by the People, for the People*, 301 pp., California: O'Reilly Media, 2004.

Las Das, D.K. and Bhaskaran, V. (eds.). (2008) *Research Methods for Social Work*, New Delhi: Rawat, pp. 173-193.

Klaus, Krippendorff. *Content Analysis: An Introduction to its Methodology* (2nd edition). London: SAGE Publications. 2004.

Midgley, James. *Social Development: The Development Perspective in Social Welfare*, SAGE Publications 1995, London.

Silverman, David. "The Logic of Qualitative Research". In *Context and Method in Qualitative Research*, eds. Miller, Gale and Dingwall, Robert, 13-25. London: SAGE Publications. 1997.

Silverstone, Roger. *Media and Morality: On the Rise of the Mediapolis*: Cambridge: Polity Press. 2007.

Waisbord, Silvio. "Can Civic Society Change Journalism? The Experience of Civic Advocacy Journalism in Latin America," *Brazilian Journalism Research*, Volume 4, Number 1: PP. 5 – 21. 2009.

Waisbord, Silvio, 2008. "Advocacy Journalism in a Global Context." In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, 295-309. New York: Routledge.

Ward, Stephen J.A. "Journalism Ethics." In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, 295-309. New York: Routledge.

Xiaoge, Xu 2008. "Development Journalism." In *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, eds. Jorgensen, Karin Wahl and Hanitzsch, Thomas, pp. 357-370. New York: Routledge.

2. Articles' Sites/URLs

1. <http://in.reuters.com/article/environmentNews/idINTRE62U1B120100331?sp=true>

(March 31, 2010, no dateline)

2. <http://www.bdnews24.com/details.php?id=148512&cid=36> (December 8, 2009, Copenhagen)

3. <http://allafrica.com/stories/201001140456.html> (14 January 2010, no dateline)

4. <http://www.scidev.net/en/news/india-boosts-climate-data-contribution-to-ipcc.html>

(February 5, 2010, New Delhi)

5. <http://www.reuters.com/article/idUSTRE63O1A520100425> (April 25, 2010, Cape Town)

6. <http://in.reuters.com/article/lifestyleMolt/idINTRE5BD23T20091214?pageNumber=2&virtualBrandChannel=0&sp=true> (December 14, 2009 Copenhagen)

7. http://www.sciencecodex.com/climate_wizard_makes_large_databases_of_climate_information_visual_accessible (December 15, 2009, no dateline)

8. <http://www.independent.co.uk/environment/climate-change/tens-of-thousands-stage-worlds-largest-climate-march-in-copenhagen-1839291.html> (December 13, 2009, Copenhagen)

9. <http://www.climatemediapartnership.org/reporting/stories/climate-protesters-maintain-hunger-strike/> (December 17, 2009 Copenhagen)

10. <http://www.nation.co.ke/News/africa/-/1066/823658/-/125mvidz/-/index.html> (December 16, 2009 Copenhagen)

11. <http://www.alertnet.org/thenews/newsdesk/ips/bd443278b5b511698c07e787ce2f8157.htm> (February 15, 2010, New York)

12. <http://in.reuters.com/article/environmentNews/idINTRE62U13M20100331?sp=true> (April 1, 2010, Oslo/London)

13. <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/environment/article7009081.ece> (January 30, 2010, no dateline)

14. <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/environment/article6999975.ece> (January 24, 2010, no dateline)

15. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2010/02/18/AR2010021801490.html> (February 19, 2010, no dateline)

16. http://news.yahoo.com/s/afp/20100426/sc_afp/algeriamediterraneanenvironmentmeet;_ylt=Ahbq6egnafpDpj5mADEJsDtpl88F;_ylu=X3oDMTNhZWxlaDI2BGFzc2V0A2FmcC8yMDEwMDQyNi9hbGdlcmhhbWVkaXRlcnJhbmVhbmVudmlyb25tZW50bWVldARwb3MDNARzZWMDDeW5fcGFnaW5hdGVfc3VtbWFyeV9saXN0BHNSawN3ZXN0bWVkaXRlcnI- (April 26, 2010 Algeria)

17. <http://ipsnews.net/news.asp?idnews=49581> (December 8, 2009, Copenhagen)
18. <http://green.pina.com.fj/article.php?id=16958508174b27b83a7d5c5c148314>
(December 16, 2009, Copenhagen)
19. <http://www.guardian.co.uk/environment/2009/dec/19/copenhagen-closes-weak-deal>
(December 19, 2009, Copenhagen)
20. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/earth/copenhagen-climate-change-confe/6843304/Copenhagen-climate-summit-deal-agreed-amid-chaos.html> (December 19, 2009, Copenhagen)
21. <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/8426835.stm> (December 22, 2009, no dateline)
22. <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/8422186.stm> (December 19, 2009, Copenhagen)
23. <http://infochangeindia.org/Environment/Despatches-from-Copenhagen/Sticking-points-at-Copenhagen-summit.html> (December 14, 2009 Copenhagen)
24. <http://newsblaze.com/story/20100101164752nava.nb/topstory.html>
(January 1, 2010, no dateline)
25. <http://rt.com/Politics/2009-12-15/political-theater-warms-copenhagen.html>
(December 15, 2009, Copenhagen)
26. [http://www.nytimes.com/2009/12/02/science/earth/02iht-euclimate.html?pagewanted=1&sq=copenhagen climate change summit december 2009&st=cse&scp=5](http://www.nytimes.com/2009/12/02/science/earth/02iht-euclimate.html?pagewanted=1&sq=copenhagen%20climate%20change%20summit%20december%202009&st=cse&scp=5) (December 1, 2009 Brussels)
27. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB126074144005789437.html> (December 14, 2009, Copenhagen)
28. [http://www.nytimes.com/2009/12/16/science/earth/16forest.html?scp=10&sq=copenhagen %20climate%20change%20summit%20december%202009&st=cse](http://www.nytimes.com/2009/12/16/science/earth/16forest.html?scp=10&sq=copenhagen%20climate%20change%20summit%20december%202009&st=cse)
(December 15, Copenhagen)

29. <http://www.scidev.net/en/policy-briefs/six-hurdles-to-delivering-climate-finance.html>
(February 11, 2010, no dateline)
30. <http://www.climatemediapartnership.org/reporting/stories/with-dragon-woman-out-philippine-climate-team-loses-teeth/> (January 31, 2010, Copenhagen)
31. <http://www.scidev.net/en/agriculture-and-environment/editorials/biodiversity-loss-matters-and-communication-is-crucial.html> (February 5, 2010, no dateline)
32. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/earth/copenhagen-climate-change-confe/6846033/Copenhagen-Accord-Questions-and-Answers.html> (December 19, 2009, Copenhagen)
33. <http://www.worldwatch.org/node/6373> (March/April 2010 issue, no dateline)
34. <http://www.reuters.com/article/idUSTRE63P00A20100426> (February 17, 2010, no dateline)
35. <http://infochangeindia.org/Environment/Despatches-from-Copenhagen/Media-melee-at-Copenhagen.html> (December 19, 2009, Copenhagen)
36. <http://invw.org/2009/12/independent-journalists-denied-access-to-copenhagen-climate-talks/>
(December 7, 2009, Copenhagen)
37. <http://www.guardian.co.uk/media/2009/dec/07/copenhagen-summit-media-army>
(December 7, 2009, Copenhagen)
38. http://www.nytimes.com/2009/12/19/science/earth/19climate.html?_r=1&scp=1&sq=copenhagen%20climate%20change%20summit%20december%202009&st=cse
(December 18, 2009 Copenhagen)
39. <http://www.guardian.co.uk/environment/2009/dec/18/copenhagen-deal>
(December 19, 2009, Copenhagen)
40. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/earth/copenhagen-climate-change-confe/6845892/Copenhagen-summit-ends-in-blood-sweat-and-recrimination.html> (December 20, 2009, Copenhagen)

3. Other Relevant References

1. Reporting Copenhagen, COP Press Kit, UNFCCC, December 2009, Copenhagen.
2. United Nations Website: <http://www.un.org/en/aboutun/index.shtml>
3. United Nations Website on Organizational Beginnings
<http://www.un.org/en/aboutun/index.shtml>
4. UNFCCC URL for media accreditation
http://unfccc.int/press/calender_of_events/accreditation/items/2987.php
5. UNFCCC URL for media workshops:
http://unfccc.int/press/media_outreach/items/3015.php
6. WEDO Gender Statement URL:
http://www.gendercc.net/fileadmin/inhalte/Dokumente/Press/WEDO_COP15_Gender_Perspective_Feb2010.pdf
7. World Bank Website on Climate Change ;
<http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/NEWS/0,,contentMDK:20432982~menuPK:34480~pagePK:64257043~piPK:437376~theSitePK:4607,00.html>
8. <http://www.epa.gov/climatechange/emissions/index.html>
9. http://unfccc.int/secretariat/history_of_the_secretariat/items/1218.php
10. http://news.mongabay.com/2009/1215-hance_ban.html
11. <http://wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn>